

Curbning Government Corruption through Empowering Public Council

FINAL REPORT

Submitted to Partnership for Transparency Fund

Project Period: December 1, 2008- July 1, 2009



July 2009

Table of Content

<i>List of Acronyms.....</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>List of Attachments.....</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>Executive Summary.....</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Project Results.....</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Activities Carried Out.....</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>Three-part meetings.....</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>Public Council Empowerment Team Meetings</i>	<i>10</i>
<i>Civil Society Consultative Meetings.....</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>Regulatory Works.....</i>	<i>22</i>
<i>One-day training for the Anti-corruption Agency and Public Council.....</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Public Council at Work Campaign.....</i>	<i>24</i>
<i>Project Performance.....</i>	<i>25</i>
<i>Project Costs.....</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>Monitoring and Evaluation.....</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>Conclusion/Recommendation.....</i>	<i>32</i>
<i>Project Sustainability</i>	<i>32</i>

List of Acronyms

<i>ACA</i>	<i>Anti-corruption Agency</i>
<i>PC</i>	<i>Public Council</i>
<i>PCET</i>	<i>Public Council Empornment Team</i>
<i>TI</i>	<i>Transparency International</i>
<i>PTF</i>	<i>Partnership for Transparency Fund</i>



List of Attachments

Attachment 1

Comparative research report “Public Councils or similar bodies for cooperation with society of anti-corruption institutions by Aiga Grisane

Attachment 2

Recommendations

Attachment 3

PC Action Plan

Attachment 4

Media Plan for “public Council at Work” campaign

Attachment 5

Program and list of participants of the second civil society consultative meeting

Attachment 6

Program and list of participants of the third civil society consultative meeting

Attachment 7

Expert’s working plan

Attachment 8

Program and list of participants of the one-day training

Attachment 9

Scanned copy of the fliers

Attachment 10

Newspaper copies

Attachment 11

Press releases and copies of newspaper news

Empowering Public Council to Curb Government Corruption

Final Report

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Globe International, a Mongolian NGO completed a six-month project “Empowering Public Council to Curb Government Corruption”, which was implemented from January 1, 2009 until July 1, 2009 under the grant of Partnership for Transparency Fund. Project’s goal was to assist in empowering Public Council that is able to take remarkable contributions to the ACA duties to curb corruption. The project implemented by Public Council Empowering Team (PCET) consisted from seven members in cooperation with the Public Council of the Anti-corruption Agency of Mongolia.

As results of the project Public Council members and civil society groups educated on the efficient Public Council and better cooperation between Public Council, NGOs and other civil society organizations enhanced and strengthened through the project’s 11 events which involved 90 persons. Recommendations on better legislation and rules of the Public Council’s efficient functioning produced in cooperation with Aiga Grisane, an TI-Lativa expert who conducted a comparative research on the public councils or similar bodies of 13 countries. Public Council, now, has its 2009 Action Plan which was produced by consultation of civil society. The Mongolian public properly informed on PC existence and importance of the participation through the public campaign “Public Council at Work”.

The project well performed and completed all the planned activities. The project was completed within its budget. The actual total expenditure was \$30,732.33 compared the budget of \$30,756.00.

Evaluation results show that the project successfully achieved its planned objectives and 81% of the respondents of the evaluation questionnaires said that they got good knowledge on the role and and recommendations on better legal environment. In accordance with the telephone interviews, 80% of the interviewees received information on Public council existence, its activities and challenges from media and the most of them want public council as supervisory body to act on behalf of the public. The project helped to PC and the ACA to have the mutual understanding in further cooperation and partnership. The activities started with the project are going to be sustainable. The Presidential office has its draft working rules to make the PC more powerful. One of the PCET members G.Erdenebat, PC member has moved there and he is the law consultancy assistant. Globe International will seek the further supports to help PC to be more sustainable in its activities on increasing the public participation.

We produced two reports: progress report and this final report. The present report includes more detailed information on the project results, activities, performance, sustainability, evaluation results and project sustainability.

2. INTRODUCTION

Globe International, a Mongolian NGO completed a six-month project “Empowering Public Council to Curb Government Corruption”, which was implemented from January 1, 2009 until July 1, 2009 under the grant of Partnership for Transparency Fund.

Project’s goal was to assist in empowering Public Council that is able to take remarkable contributions to the ACA duties to curb corruption. We reached the following objectives that were anticipating having after six months:

- Public Council members and civil society groups educated on the efficient Public Council
- Recommendations on better legislation and rules regulating the Public Council’s efficient functioning produced
- Better cooperation between Public Council, NGOs and other civil society organizations enhanced and strengthened
- The public properly informed on PC existence and their participation increased

The project implemented by a GI project staff in cooperation with the Public Council of the Anti-corruption Agency of Mongolia. The project formed Public Council Empowering Team (PCET) consisted from three project staff and four other members: two members of the Public Council and representatives of two NGOs: Zorig Foundation and Center of Human Rights and Security.

During the project period, in total 11 events organized and involved 90 persons: two three- part meetings, six PCET meetings and three civil society consultative meetings. The project cooperated with Aiga Grisane, an expert from Transparency International-Latvia, who conducted comparative research and produced legal recommendations, which was handed over to the Anti-corruption agency.

We have received 4,950 USD as the first installment of the grant in December 2008 and 17,500 USD as the second installment in April 2009. Total budget of the project is 25,000 USD and total expenditure of the project activities is 25,022.83 USD, so 2,500 USD to be invoiced.

3. PROJECT RESULTS

- PCET consisting from seven members coordinated and carried out the project activities through six meetings and cooperated with the ACA through two three-party meetings, involvement to the PCET meetings, project events and television programs
- Comparative research titled “Public Councils or similar bodies for cooperation with society of Anti-corruption institutions” conducted by with Aiga Grisane, an expert of TI-Latvia and presented to the training of the ACA PC. The research included the

experiences of the similar bodies of 13 countries: Hong Kong, New South Wales, Australia, Singapore, Lithuania, Latvia, South Korea, Poland, Tanzania, Romania, Austria, France, Albania and Slovenia. **Attachment No 1**

- Recommendations on the favorable legal environment of PC available and presented to the 3d civil society consultative meeting and handed over to the ACA of Mongolia

Attachment No 2

- PC Action Plan for 2009 available and handed over the ACA. **Attachment No 3**
- In total, 90 people informed in the present PC situation, the project activities and similar bodies of other countries through three civil society consultative meetings, training and contributed their ideas on proper PC
- PC has its logo and the public informed in the Presidential Decree on the PC's establishment, its existence and members' contacts through 200 copies of educational fliers as a part of "Public Council at Work. It also educates the public on what is corruption and corruption crimes and hotline telephone number 1969 to receive the information from the people on corruption cases
- "Public Council at Work" campaign included the media rally which included in total 8 media materials: four newspaper publications and four television programs and the public informed in the PC activities, role and duties, the present legal environment and why it needs to be improved. Media plan is attached. **Attachment No 4**
- Project activities publicized through GI website and reported by 8 news of the main newscasts of television channels such as Mongolian National Public Television, NTV, Channel 25, SBN, NTV and newspapers; Mongol Messenger, English weekly, Unen, daily and daily English newsletter of MONTSAME, news agency

The project formed the Public Council Empowering Team (PCET) that included three project staff and other four members –representatives of NGOs and PC. Names are below:

Project staff:

Kh. Naranjargal	Project leader
Ch. Munkhzul	Project coordinator

PCET Members:

G. Erdenebat	Chairman of legal sub-council of the Public
Ch.Choisamba	Chairman of educational sub-council of the Public
G.Gerelmaa	Zorig Foundation
M.Sukhbaatar	Human Rights and Security, NGO

4. ACTIVITIES CARRIED OUT

4.1 Three part meetings

The project had the first meeting with the ACA on January 9, 2009 at the ACA meeting room.

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader, GI
Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator, GI
E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman
Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
Sh. Radnaased, Chairman of the Prevention and Education Department, Commissioner
J.Tumurkhuyag, Officer of the ACA Prevention and Education Department
J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Two main issues were on the agenda: project introduction and formation of the PCET.

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader thanked the PC and ACA for supporting an initiative of Globe International and their commitment to cooperate on the empowerment of the PC. She introduced the project, its objectives and activities.

Mr. Sh.Radnaased welcomed the cooperation and expressed his hope that the project will take a great contribution to the ACA activities on curbing corruption.

Mr. E.Borlochuluun has offered the two PC sub-council chairmen to include to the PCET. After discussion, the meeting participants agreed to involve Zorig Foundation and Center for Human Rights and Security as far as these NGOs have been active in anti-corruption activities.

Mr. Sh.Radnaased said that the project has come in time because the ACA is trying to build NGO network in the provinces and this project will be valuable in increasing the public participation in anti-corruption affairs and promoting the public education. He also mentioned that the project can invite an expert from Hong Kong who previously has worked in Mongolia.

The meeting agreed to organize the first PCET meeting on January 12, 2009 and discuss the project activities in detail, work out the precise activity schedule and tasks of the PCET members. It also was agreed that J.Tumurkhuyag will be a key person to represent the ACA in the project.

The meeting also agreed that there are no needs to meet every week. The meeting should be held at any time, if it is needed.

The second three part meeting was held at the ACA meeting room on March 13, 2009

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation
D.Dulamsuren, Anti-Corruption Agency
J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Absent: M.Sukhbaatar

The meeting started at 14.00 and the project leader moderated the meeting.

Agenda:

- Introduction of the Latvian expert
- Work plan during the expert's visit: training and 2d CSC meeting
- Exchange of ideas on venue, participants and program
- Content of educational fliers
- Preparations of the one-day training

Full minutes of the two meetings are available in Mongolian. **Attachments submitted to the progress report**

Discussion:

- The project leader introduced the participants with the expert's CV, profile and contract signed
- Bolorchuluu and Erdenebat should start working with the expert already now because they are lawyers and speak Russian. The project coordinator will send her e-mails to everybody
- We have to decide what the working language is during the events. Russian or English
- We should think and sent our ideas on the training program to the expert. Could it be simple and basic knowledge on the corruption and its types etc or should it be advanced
- All the PC members should be attending the training, so they have to know about the dates and adjust their work schedules
- We should involve some other NGOs because some they want it. These NGOs can be the potential PC members after the termination of the present PC
- Draft legal regulations should be discussed by the 2d CSC meeting

- It is better if the training organized on the second day of the expert's visit and CSC meeting – on the 3d day. PCET members should work together in other days. We should have one day after the events and work together on the recommendations of the CSC meeting
- PCET has to know about their works to be done prior the expert's arrival

Agreed:

- Organize the 4th PCET meeting at 16.00 on March 28, 2009 at GI office
- Contact M.Sukhbaatar and inform the date and venue of the meeting
- PCET members to e-mail the slogans, pictures, calls that they want to see in the fliers
- Start preparations of the events during the expert's visit
- Date is for the training is April 22 and for CSC meeting- April 23

4.2 Public Council Empowerment Team Meetings

Team Meeting 1

The first meeting was held on January 12, 2009 at Globe International office

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
 Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
 E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman
 Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
 G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
 M.Sukhbaatar, HR and Security, NGO
 J.Tumurkhuyag, Anti-Corruption Agency
 J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Full minutes are in Mongolian taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary.

Agenda

- Selection of the second NGO to work in PCET team
- Detailed work plan
- Tasks of the PCET members and draft TOR of the contract
- Inviting an international expert. Criteria and requirements
- The first Civil Society Consultative Meeting: date, venue, list of participants and agenda

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader opened the meeting and she noted that civil society support is very important and the public should know what we do and such project is going on.

The team discussed the project objectives and activities in detail in accordance with the Detailed Working Plan and the present activities of the PC.

The Working Plan was adopted by the PCET members. **Attached to the progress report**

Main issues pointed out:

Tasks of the PCET members

- Take their contribution to make the project most successful and achieve the project objectives
- The members of the PC and NGOs work and GI project staff organises and coordinates the activities
- Strive to make the NGOs and CSOs as our partners, not fight with them. Civil society structure in Mongolia is various and NGOs are different

The present situation of the PC s

- Many PC members are still not aware why they are in the PC. The ACA organised one-day training once on what is corruption and types of the corruption for the PC members and they think it is not enough.
- Some of the PC members had met an expert from Hong Kong and he told about their experiences, but not particular advices how to make the PC more powerful
- The PC activities are very weak, so it is almost nothing to inform the public
- The ACA representative said that they founded NGO networks in 21 provinces and the first training will be held on January 20-22, 2009. They are also planning to organise the regional meetings in three aimags every quarter this year and they are planning to involve the PC members

Potential expert

- Some of the members suggested inviting an expert from Asian country. The Hong Kong expert seemed he is very experienced in controlling the corruption crime, but the Mongolian PC does not have any legal grounds for such works
- The most PCET members preferred having the expert from European country because our educational and historical backgrounds are the same and mentality is very similar. May be Russia or one of the former soviet countries, or from European developed countries or from Eastern European former communist countries

The first Civil Society Consultative Meeting

- It should be in participatory approach, not just lecturing one and others listening

- Presentations should be short and well focused on the topic. Choismba will prepare presentation on the PC goals, objectives, Erdenebat- on the legal regulations and Sukhbaatar on the legal environment on fighting corruption crime because the public should know what legal problems has the ACA in investigating corruption crimes
- It is better to organise the meeting in February
- Draft programme should be developed very soon and PCET members will contribute
- Develop the list of participants carefully and PCET members will contribute

The meeting agreed:

- Invite Zorig Foundation as PCET member because they have active in anti-corruption issues and one of the most ethical NGOs
- Create an e-mail network of the PCET members and the ACA representative
- Seek an expert from TI-Latvia because it is one of the strongest among TI network
- Prepare the legal documents and start translations now
- Project coordinator will draft contract and send to PCET members by e-mail
- Date for the meeting should be re-discussed
- PCET members will send their appropriate time schedules to the project coordinator in order to fix the date
- Project coordinator will produce the agenda for the next meeting and send by e-mail
- Project coordinator will draft the programme based on the discussions here
- Erdenebat, Choisamba and Sukhbaatar will send the concepts of their presentations the mailing list and PCET members contribute their ideas
- Erdenebat will send a short concept paper on what we want from the expert and send the potential expert
- The project leader will start seeking an expert from Latvia via her contacts
- Inform the media in project activities

Team Meeting 2

The second meeting was held on January 27, 2009 at Globe International office.

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
 E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman
 Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
 Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
 G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
 M.Sukhbaatar, HR and Security, NGO
 B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation

Full minutes are taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary and available in Mongolian. **Attached to the Progress Report**

The project leader moderated the meeting and she welcomed Gerelmaa, a new PCET member representing Zorig Foundation

Agenda:

- Preparation of the first Civil Society Consultative Meeting
- Information on the international expert
- Exchange of ideas on publication of the fliers
- Signing the contract

Preparation of the first Civil Society Consultative Meeting

- By e-mail, it is agreed to hold the first consultative meeting at 14.00 on 6th February of 2009
- Media release should be prepared and posted in GI website
- Two places discussed; The round room of the Mongolian Chamber of Commerce and conference room of the National Legal Center
- Presentations should be ready 3 days prior to meeting to copy. Concepts are ready. Erdenbat and Sukhbaatar will change the titles of their presentations and will send it to the project coordinator tomorrow
- Participants will be formed into groups and discuss their ideas how to make the PC more powerful and suggest us how to achieve our objectives in the most effective ways
- The list of participants agreed by e-mail. Some other people can be added as soon, before we deliver the invitations

Information on the international expert

The project leader informed that she contacted TI-Latvia and she sent the project document and a background paper on need of the expert. She said she hopes the contract will be signed in February. She is drafting the text and TOR of the contract.

Exchange of ideas on publication of the fliers

- Fliers should be in A5 size and 6-8 pages. If we want to put the photos and resumes of the PC, we would need more spaces
- The public should know how to contact the PC. How the ordinary citizens directly contact you? Calling, e-mailing or what else?
- E-mails and names of their work places can be put
- Slogans are important
- Nice picture is important
- PC logo is needed or we can use the ACA logo
- Goals, objectivise, Presidential Decree or what other texts should be put
- How about activity directions?
- Call addressed to the public to curb corruption. Something like Please join us?

- May be, some words like “Power Corrupts and Absolute Power Absolutely Corrupts’ or corruption is abuse of power or corruption is social cancer
- We can use children’s pictures that got prizes
- We have to discuss it again in details because the PC does not have any office, general telephone etc

Decision

- Signed the contracts **Attached to the Progress Report**
- Organise the first Civil Society Consultative meeting on February 06, 2009 at the conference room of the National Legal Center
- Launch the PC logo
- Prepare a short introduction on the PC and deliver to the project coordinator within 5 days
- Offer the names and organisations to the list of participants
- Erdenebat, Choisamba, Sukhbaatar will submit their presentations 5 days prior the consultative meeting
- The project staff will provide preparations: refreshments, meals, background materials, room rent etc

Team Meeting 3

The third meeting was held on 18th March of 2009 at Globe International office

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
 E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman
 Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
 Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
 G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
 M.Sukhbaatar, HR and Security, NGO
 B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation
 J.Enkhtuul, team secretary

Minutes were taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary and available in Mongolian. **Attached to the Progress Report**

Agenda:

- Draft Action Plan
- Adoption of the content of the educational fliers
- Second CSC meeting preparations
- Training preparations

The meeting decided to postpone the discussion of the draft action plan to the next meeting

Decision:

- Content of the fliers approved and the project coordinator will send to the designer
- Gerelmaa will send the photos or paintings to the project manager
- Choisamba will be responsible for the text and he should meet Erdenebat and Sukhbaatar on March 20th and send the materials to the project coordinator on March 25th
- The text and other materials needed for the fliers should be approved within March 28th
- Erdenebat will send his ideas on the training program to Aiga
- Sukhbaatar will find the list of NGO network from the ACA and its contacts
- All members are to bring the list of the suggested participants to the next meeting

Team Meeting 4

The fourth meeting was held on 17 April AT Globe International office. Minutes were taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary and available in Mongolian. **English summary is below**

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation
D.Dulamsuren, Anti-Corruption Agency
Sukhbaatar, Human Rights and Security, NGO
D.Tsend-Ayush, ACA
J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Agenda:

- On-going project activities
- Discussion of working programme for Aiga Grisane, TI-Latvia expert
- Approval of design of the educational fliers
- Discuss the draft action plan
- Preparation of the one-day training

Decision:

- Approved expert's working programme.
- Design of the educational fliers approved
- Discuss the action plan with the expert and present to the second consultative meeting
- Programmed for the one-day training approved

Team Meeting 5

The fifth meeting was held on April 23 2009 at Terelj camp

Minutes were taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary and available in Mongolian. English summary is below:

Attendees:

Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation
M.Sukhbaatar, Human Rights and Security, NGO
J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Agenda:

- Discuss the final version of recommendations
- Approval of the media plan

Decision:

- To present the final version of recommendations to the third civil society consultative meeting
- Media plan approved and the project staff will contact the media outlets
- It is agreed to start media campaign after the campaign of Presidential elections on media ends because promotion of PC through media can be misunderstood by the public because PC was established by the Presidential Decree. In other hand it also can be accepted as the present President N.Enkhbayar's election advertisement because he is one of only two candidates.
- The team also decided any information on PC should not appear on the media and to move the 3d CS consultative to June. It should be organized by the end of June as an evaluation meeting to allow talk more about the results of the project

Team Meeting 6

The sixth meeting was held on 26 June 2009 at Globe International office. Minutes were taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary and available in Mongolian. **English summary is below:**

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator

Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation
M.Sukhbaatar, Human Rights and Security, NGO
J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Agenda:

- Approval of the third civil society consultative meeting
- Agree in the list of invitees
- Progress on the media rally
- Evaluation of the project

Decision:

- To invite the ACA to hand over the recommendations and action plan
- To inform the participants in the project results
- G.Erdenebat and Ch.Choisamba to present the recommendations and action plan
- Send the official letter to the ACA leaders
- Develop and distribute the evaluation forms to the participants and call to the ordinary citizens, if they receive the information through media

4.3 Civil Society Consultative meetings

Civil Society Meeting 1

The meeting was organized on February 6, 2009 at the conference room of the National Legal Center. It involved 25 participants represented the Anti-corruption Agency, PC members, National Human Rights Commission and NGOs.

Mr. E. Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman opened and moderated the meeting.

Agenda:

- Introduction on the Public Council of the Anti-corruption Agency
Ch.Choisamba, Chairman of the PC Sub-council on Public Participation and Public Opinion
- The legal environment of PC. Advantages and Disadvantages, and Challenges
G.Erdenebat, PC Sub-council on law implementation and corruption
- The legal environment for fighting corruption crime
M. Sukhbaatar, Human Rights and Security, NGO

- The objectives and activities of the project “Empowering the Public Council to Curb Government Corruption
Kh.Naranjargal, Globe International President and CEO, project leader
- Group Work: How to establish good cooperation and efficient partnership between PC and civil society and to achieve the project objectives?

Discussions:

- National Human Rights Commission is suggesting organising the training “Corruption and Human Rights”. They also think it will be very useful and helpful, if the PC cooperates with the courts, police and the General Authority of the Implementation of the Court Decisions) in organising the meetings and trainings
- Anti-corruption law and other related laws must be changed
- The PC must be active in educating the public and raising their awareness
- The PC must have its groups to carry out permanent activities
- The PC members must have knowledge on the corruption issues and its operation and activities
- Cooperate with the Civil Society Council which is an official network of CSOs and the Government
- Set up more deep connections and relationships with NGOs specially focusing on anti-corruption education, transparency, government bureaucracy and corruption study and research institutions

The project leader asked the participants to think and write down their thoughts “How do you see a proper PC?”

- Initiative and constantly promotes its activities
- Push the ACA to make their goals and objectives reached
- Has good activity plans and strives to achieve its goals and objectives
- Has permanent activities
- Has good partnership with other organisations
- Has favourable legal environment
- Be transparent
- Be powerful
- Has its branches in the provinces
- Takes public control over the ACA activities
- Regularly meets the ordinary people and hear their opinions
- Continuously promotes its activities via media
- Has good financing

In order to make the PC more powerful the participants see the main difficulties faced by the PC as follows:

- No budget to carry out activities
- No permanent office or permanent secretary to coordinate the PC members and its activities
- No good working plan
- No experiences
- No commitment of some PC members
- No awareness of some PC members why they are here and what they should do

Group brainstorming

The participants formed into four groups to brainstorm on how to efficiently work to achieve the project objectives

Outcomes of Brainstorming:

Group 1/Objective 1: Objective: Public Council members and civil society groups educated on the efficient Public Council

- The PC should cooperate with Civil Society Council
- The PC should conduct training for Civil Society Council member organisations
- The PC members should be acquainted with the similar organisations in other countries. Study tours could be efficient
- Publish handbook on the PC goals, activities and importance
- To have its own air time on the public television to educate the public on corruption consequences
- The PC members should be highly educated, so they should enhance their knowledge and skills
- The PC will strive to have good results
- It should be better, if the most of PC members are lawyers

Group 2/Objective 2: Recommendations on better legislation and rules regulating the Public Council's efficient functioning produced

- Make the PC related provision of the Anti-corruption law more clear and include clear and narrow regulations on the PC powers, duties and activities. It must be regulated by law, not the Working Rules adopted by the Presidential Decree
- Include the provision to the Anti-corruption law to guarantee the financial capacity of the PC. It can be included to the ACA budget
- Include the provision to the Anti-corruption law to provide power to take control or supervise corruption crimes and complains of the citizens that are not accepted or annulled by the ACA

- Make amendments to the Anti-corruption law and Criminal Law and include the followings as crimes:
 - ✓ Suddenly get rich
 - ✓ Money laundering
 - ✓ Bank crimes
 - ✓ Include the ACA to the list of powers to access the bank information from the banks
- Enact a law on the conflict of interests or add the relevant provisions to the existing Anti-corruption law

Group 3/Objective 3: Better cooperation between Public Council, NGOs and other civil society organizations enhanced and strengthened

- The PC should have the list of NGOs committed to contribute to the curbing corruption and set up the permanent contact and exchange information
- The PC should have permanent day that NGOs come and exchange information and opinions
- Create NGO network. The ACA is building up such network in the provinces. The similar activities should be carried out in the capital.
- Provide the NGO networks with information and enable to exchange information
- Take control over the local administration budget. The three part contract was signed by the local administration, the ACA and local NGOs. 10% of the total budget of the local administration was allocated for anti-corruption actions and activities
- The PC should have its page in the ACA website and regularly update the information
- Launch the online information network to promote and encourage the public participation

Group 4: The public properly informed on PC existence and their participation increased

- Organise media campaign and cooperate with media to report on the PC activities
- Produce the printed materials educating the citizens on the need and importance of their participation
- The PC members should be able to introduce their works to the public through regular meetings
- The PC should have a structure to receive the public requests and complains.

Please see the program, list of participants, invitations. **Attached to the Progress Report**

Civil Society Meeting 2

The meeting was held on April 23, 2009 at BishreIt Hotel and it involved 21 participants.

Meeting was aimed at presenting the results of the comparative research on public councils or similar bodies discuss the recommendations and PC action plan. E.Bolorchuluun, PC chairman moderated the meeting.

Agenda:

- Opening and introducing Aiga Grisane, TI-Latvia expert
- Presentation of the results of the comparative research by Aiga Grisane
- Presentation of the recommendations by G.Erdenebat PC sub-council chairman
- Presentation of the draft action plan by Ch.Choisamba, PC sub-council chairman
- Questions and answers
- Discussion

Outcomes:

- The authorities abuse the bad regulation since there is no conflict of interest law
- It is thankful that PC is committed to improve their activities
- Promotion and information on PC are very important
- Independence of PC is very crucial
- People think it is a part of the President's duties. Sometimes it is also understood as Parliament's responsibility to take control. Indeed, it is not. The ACA is out of the control. PC should take care of it
- Terminology is very important. Should PC be as a part of the ACA or under the ACA or should it be independent? PC should not be an organ to support the ACA activities
- The ACA should be transparent. PC should contribute to this. The ACA presents its report to the Parliament. Can it be open to the public?
- Law provisions regulating PC are not so clear. Is it only role of PC to produce recommendations by law? According to the working rules PC should support the ACA activities, but how? Only in anti-corruption education or activities to prevent from corruption?
- PC powers are very limited
- PC should efficiently use the media to raise awareness on their problems and improve the law and make the amendments to the Criminal law
- Now mechanisms on how ACA and PC cooperate on education and communication, and prevention? The ACA has the budget and its special department, but PC has nothing
- Ethics should be taught at schools and universities
- Develop a program for kindergartens
- PC should work on engaging the public to its activities

*Please see the program and list of participants. **Attachments No 5.1-5.2***

Agreed that PC will include the proposals said by the participants to the present draft recommendations and present the final version to the 3d consultative meeting

Civil Society Meeting 3

The consultative meeting was organized on 29 June 2009 at Bishrelt Hotel. The meeting involved 21 participants. Please see the program and list of participants. ***Attachments No 6.1-6.2***

Mr. E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman introduced the participants with the results of the project. G.Erdenebat and Ch.Choisamba, the PC sub-council presented the recommendations and action plan.

Participants represented the ACA, PC, NGOs and media endorsed the policy documents produced by the project. They stressed on that PC has to be active and initiative to implement their plan and PC should be more close to the ACA in fulfilling their objectives

The main focus of the discussion was that if it's obligatory that the ACA accepts the PC recommendations. The participants also pointed out that if the ACA can be transparent institution and PC has access to ACA records.

4.4 Regulatory Works and Expert's Contribution

Aiga Grisane- lawyer from TI-Latvia cooperated with the project under the contract signed between Laura Mikelsons, TI-Latvia Director and Kh.Naranjargal, Globe International President and CEO.

Aiga Grisane's profile, CV and contract attached to the Progress Report

The expert worked in Ulaanbaatar between 20- 25th of April 2009 and she has:

- Provided the comparative research of the public councils or similar bodies existing in other countries in such as powers, responsibilities and duties, formation (nomination and appointing) and decision-making processes, activities etc.
- Produced the Recommendations on proper PC related provision of the Anti-corruption Law of Mongolia and Working Rules of PC
- Assisted productions of the PC Action Plan and of the Recommendations through PCET meetings
- Presented her report on comparative research to the training and civil society consultative meeting

The following materials sent to the expert.

- The project document(English)
- The Anti-corruption law of Mongolia (English)
- The Presidential Decree to establish the PC
- The PC Working Rules adopted by the President

- An introductory document on the present legal environment produced by Mr. G. Erdenebat, PhD, PC Sub-Council Chairman and Professor of the Law School of the Mongolian State University

English translations attached to the Progress Report

During her stay in Ulaanbaatar PCET worked together on the recommendations to present it to the training and civil society consultative meeting.

Please see her working program in Mongolia. **Attachment No 7**

4.5 One-day training for the ACA and PC

The training was held on 22 April 2009 at Bishreilt Hotel and involved 24 participants representing the ACA and Public Council. Training moderated by E.Bolorchuluun, PC chairman and opened by Kh.Naranjargal, project leader.

The participants of the training educated on the followings:

- Conflict of Interests and its legal framework. Trainer G.Erdenebat, PC sub-council chairman
- Corruption and its nature, reasons and harms. Trainer D.Dulamsuren, senior expert of the ACA Education and Prevention Department
- Public Councils or similar bodies for cooperation with society of the anti-corruption agencies. Presenter Aiga Grisane, expert of Transparency International-Latvia

Mrs. D.Dulamsuren also introduced the participants with the ACA activities.

During the training the participants asked the questions and exchanged their views on the ACA and PC activities and relationship and they focused on:

- PC should not be ACA entity. The regulations say it is under the ACA. The terminology also should be taken into consideration. It should be independent organ
- The ACA's position is that we should talk more about the integrity rather than corruption
- We till do not have the proper research and corruption index within the country, so it is difficult to say which organizations/institutions or officials are more corrupted
- The ACA is not controlled by any body, so PC should be an organ to take the control and make the ACA more responsible
- The anti-corruption education should be started earlier from the kindergarten
- The ethical issues of the public officials are problematic, so it is also crucial to talk about it

The participants discussed the draft recommendations produced by the PCET in assistance of the Latvian expert. Outcomes are:

- The law provision and the working rules are contradictory. Law says PC is to produce the recommendations, but the working rules say PC should support the ACA activities. It is not obligatory for the ACA to respond to PC recommendations
- Duties are unclear and it is very similar to the duties of the education and prevention department. The ordinary people would not distinguish who is carrying out the education and prevention activities
- PC responsibility and accountability should be also defined by the working rules
- The law provision should be extended and PC duties and powers should be set up by the law, not by the working rules

PCET is agreed to include the proposals of the participants to the recommendations and finalize it.

Please see the program and list of participants. ***Attachments 8.1-8.2***

4.6 “Public Council at Work” campaign

Campaign aimed at informing the public in the existence of the ACA Public Council and role of public council and public participation in curbing corruption. PCET developed a media plan.

Campaign included:

- Production and distribution of 2000 copies of educational fliers. ***Attachment 9***
- In total four television programmes aired: three discussion programs by NTV, Eagle, and MN 25, and a 20-min documentary by SBN
- Four interviews with the PC members published by 3 newspapers: *Odriin Sonin*, daily, *Deedsiin Khureelen*, weekly and *Ulaanbaatar Times*, daily. Please see the newspaper copies. ***Attachments No 10.1-10.4***

Project Publicity

The project invited the media outlets to cover on the project events and produced the press releases.

- Four television channels reported on the first CSC meeting
- Training for PC and NGO covered by SBN, Mongolian National Public TV and Mongol Messenger, English weekly and daily English newsletter of MONTSAME, news agency
- Second civil society consultative meeting reported by Eagle and NTV
- Third civil society consultative meeting covered by Mongolian National Public TV and SBN and Unen, daily

Please see the press release on the events in Mongolian and copies of the print media materials. ***Attachments 11.1-11.4***

The project posted the information on the activities to GI web site at www.globeinter.org.mn and the following links can be viewed:

Empowering Public Council

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&menuid=341>

Empowering Public Council - new project started

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=539&menuid=341>

First ever consultative meeting of civil society held

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=569&menuid=341>

Decree of the President of Mongolia

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=571&menuid=341>

Empowering Public Council to Curb Government Corruption

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=570&menuid=341>

Mongolian Civil Society contributes to curbing the corruption

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=574&menuid=341>

Public Council members of the Anti-corruption Agency to be educated

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=572&menuid=341>

Public Council members of the Anti-corruption Agency educated

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=584&menuid=341>

Mongolian Civil Society supports the legal reform

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=586&menuid=341>

Public Council at Work

<http://www.globeinter.org.mn/index.php?cmd=Record&id=632&menuid=341>

Information in Mongolian posted at: <http://globeinter.org.mn/?cmd=Record&menuid=342>

5. PROJECT PERFORMANCE

Months	Activities planned	Activities carried	Comments
I	Project preparation: detailed working plan, formation of PCET, meeting with the PC and ACA, contract with international expert, project publicity started	Working plan produced PCET formed and contracts signed. 2 PCET meetings held 2 PCET and ACA meetings held	
II	Relevant documents translated into English, 1 st consultative meeting organized. Preparation of the training and consultative	Contract with TI-Latvia signed on Feb.18, 2009. 5 documents sent to the	

	meeting started	<p>expert. Three newly translated</p> <p>The first CS Consultative meeting held on February 6, 2009 and involved 25 participants</p> <p>Four television channels covered the event</p>	
III	International expert arrived, training and consultative meeting organized. Media covered on the events	<p>One PCET meeting held</p> <p>Team worked on the media plan and content development of fliers</p>	Expert could come in April 2009, so the events organized in April
IV	3d consultative meeting organized and campaign strategy available. Media covered the event	<p>Training conducted and involved 24 participants</p> <p>2d CSC meeting held and involved 21 participants</p> <p>2 PCET meetings held</p> <p>2000 copies of fliers printed</p>	
V	Public campaign started. Fliers distributed production of television programs started. PCET and PC members interviewed by media	<p>Media plan available</p> <p>Fliers distributed</p>	In May the Presidential election took place. The team decided to move the media rally because PC is established by the Presidential Decree and information on PC could understood as election advertising.
VI	Television programs aired, evaluations taken	3d consultative meeting held and involved 21 participants	

		4 television programs aired	
		4 newspaper materials published	
		Letter sent to Mr. Sangragchaa, the ACA chairman	
		Evaluations taken	

6. PROJECT COSTS

The project was completed within its budget. The actual total expenditure was \$30,732.33 compared the budget of \$30,756.00, giving a small saving of \$23.67. PTF provided \$25,000 while Globe International contributed the remaining amount, \$5,732.33. PTF has so far paid \$22,500 (of this \$50 were deducted by banks as their fee); the balance, \$2,500 is due to be received from PTF. All expenditures were within budgeted limits".

7. MONITORING AND EVALUATION

The project was monitored by the project leader and activities had been precisely discussed by the PCET. Minutes of the meetings are available and English summaries are available in the progress and final reports.

The project produced two reports including this one. The progress report along with the detailed financial report sent to the PTF.

Evaluations were taken through evaluation questionnaires and telephone calls to the ordinary citizens.

Evaluation Results:

7.1 Evaluation questionnaires

Questionnaires distributed to 20 participants of the 3d consultative meeting and 16 received. 75% or the biggest portion of responses said that the project was very important and contributed to the development of cooperation and partnership between civil societies. The lowest percentage or 43.8% of the respondents think that the project was very important and contributed to have knowledge on the role and activities of PC while 2 persons (12.5%) said it is not important.

In general more than 50 % of the respondents said the project was very important and took contribution to the PC and CS to learn experiences of other countries and increase an impact, improvement of the legal environment for PC, promotion of the cooperation between the ACA and PC and it was very important for the citizens to have understanding on PC and to be informed on PC activities, and PC has its working plan.

81.3% of respondents said that they obtained good knowledge on the role of PC and recommendations to make the better legal environment. 37.5% said that they still do not have knowledge on PC members and 18.8%- an average while 50% have the good knowledge on PC members

37.5% of answers say their knowledge on the action plan is average while 12.5% -poor while 50% have information.

Evaluation statistics are below:

How do you evaluate the importance of the project?

Contribution	Very important	Important	No important	No response
Development of cooperation and partnership between civil society and PC	12	4		
PC and CS to learn experiences of other countries and increase an impact	8	8		
Knowledge on the role and activities of PC	7	7	2	
Improve the legal environment for PC	11	5		
Promote the cooperation between the ACA and PC	8	8		
Important for the citizens to have understanding on PC	11	5		
Important for citizens to be informed on PC activities	9	6	1	
PC has its working plan	11	5		

What is your knowledge on PC?

Knowledge on	Good	Average	No knowledge
Role of PC	13	3	
Powers of PC	9	6	1
Legal framework of PC	9	4	3
Activities of PC	11	5	
PC members	8	2	6
Recommendations to make the better legal environment	13	3	
Action plan of PC	8	6	2

100% of the respondents said it is necessary to improve PC legal environment

93.8% of respondents replied that there is a need for the further projects to support PC.

To a question what kind of the projects in need the respondents said:

- Assist in PC practical works
- Inform the citizens in the existence of a such structure
- Cooperate with civil society organizations on the organizing training and increase information and communication
- Assist on sustainability and strengthen PC
- Encourage the initiatives of PC
- Assist in creation of cooperation mechanisms of the ACA and PC
- Assist in finding the funds for PC activities
- Create a system to receive the public opinions, submit the recommendations and demand response to inquires and recommendations

7.2 Telephone calls

The PCET secretary called to 25 people to assess, if they received the information on PC through media outlets. 20 people received the information and 5 not. 80% of respondents that received information said they have it from:

- 2 from newspaper interviews
- 4 from interview on Eagle channel
- 2 from news of the National Public TV
- 4 from 40-minute discussion program of channel NTV
- 1 from 20-min documentary of channel SBN
- 7 from a one hour discussion program of MN 25 channel

The citizens said:

1. I just recently found out that there is PC. It seemed to me that they have many difficulties in carrying out activities. PC should be open to the public. I think the PC should not be appointed by the President. It must be the real public representatives, so the people should nominate them
2. It seemed to me that PC is very important supervisory organ. When you listen to the PC members, unfortunately their works are not so effective because of their bad working conditions. I think the ACA should support their activities
3. I do not understand why the President appoints the PC members. I think it is weakness. The PC is public, so the citizens should appoint them. If the regulations are good, I think it can work efficiently
4. I think the structure is very important, but I do not like how PC members are elected. The citizens should appoint the members
5. I have just got the information on PC existence. PC should promote its activities to the public. PC must be close to the public. I think it should supervise the ACA.
6. I recently got the information. I am supporting it. I wish PC to work more effectively. PC should permanently inform the public on its activities as well as the ACA works
7. There is need for a council in order to supervise the ACA. I wish they work more effectively

8. I have just learnt from Eagle channel that PC is comparatively new and the members face many difficulties. I think PC is very important. I do not think that it is right that the President appoints the members
9. We have to support PC members to make them more powerful. I think PC can be more efficient, if the ACA and PC should supervise each other and closely cooperate
10. May be PC is new. That is why it is not well known. They have to make the people know about them. I think there is need that they have to inform the public on their activities more frequently
11. PC works must be intensified. I seemed to me PC is good. They have to think how to cooperate with the public more closely
12. I have got very good information. The PC members have to be honest and fair and supervise the ACA and constantly inform the public about the results
13. I have information on PC. I am little bit disappointed that PC members' working conditions are not so good. I do not want PC as a symbol
14. There is crucial need for PC. The main issues are how appoints its members and how it is legally regulated
15. I think the working conditions of PC must be good. PC members are not volunteers. That is why they need good support
16. I have just found out about PC. I think it is very important organ. I hope the citizens will support them
17. I have information on the duties. I think it is important organ. PC has to be close to the public
18. PC should supervise the ACA. PC members must be openly elected
19. I did not know about PC before. The most important is that PC starts from the members
20. I like the structure. I have learnt that unfortunately, PC does not have own budget, duties are not so clear and their possibilities are limited. It seemed to me that PC must be empowered

Concluding the results of the evaluation, the project reached the target group and its activities are successful. Promoting the further PC activities, the members should distribute more information on who are the members, what are their opinions and get a more actively engaged

to the PC activities. The commitment of some members is still not so good. The evaluation shows the public commitment to support the ACA PC and they want more powerful PC that is able to supervise the ACA. They want more transparent and accountable ACA.

8. CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATIONS

The project has successes in achieving its objectives. Public Council has its logo and its activities carried out by the project well accepted by the ACA. PC members are more active and aware of their duties and they are willing to continue the activities started by the project. The project helped to PC and the ACA to have the mutual understanding in further cooperation and partnership. Public Council cooperated actively with the most active Mongolian NGOs and they took their contributions how to make PC more powerful. The public received information on the existence of PC and has the contacts of PC.

But PC still needs some support to become a real power and engage the public to their works. So the project is recommending the followings:

- Establish the working group to draft the amendments to the Anti-corruption law and working rules
- Launch a advocacy and lobby campaign for passage of the relevant amendments
- See support of the new elected President to make changes in the working rules and to make the PC nomination and appointing processes
- Assist PC to carry out its activities included in the Action Plan
- Stimulate the promotion of PC and its activities through media to engage more public support
- Help PC to learn the best experiences of other countries through study trips and cooperation with other similar bodies abroad

9. PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY

The project is sustainable in the following ways:

- Public Council members and the ACA staff are well aware of making the legal environment. The newly elected President's office accepted the recommendations and draft of PC Working Rules is available

- PC members well educated on the role and powers of public council and similar bodies in other countries and they are committed to use their abilities to their further works
- Civil society organizations involved to the project activities are keen to cooperate with PC, so the further collaborations are taking place. The ACA has organized an NGO network in the provinces and it consists from 25 local NGOs. Some of them attended the project's training and civil society meeting
- The public has information on the existence of PC and evaluations show they are willing to get the public support
- The activities started by the project are going to be continued by PC in accordance with their action plan
- One of the PCET members G.Erdenebat, PC member became a law consultancy assistant of the President, so we hope he will take of the further regulatory works

At last, Globe International is still keen to support PC and its activities, so we will seek the further supports from the local and international donors.

Report by Naranjargal Khashkhuu, project leader

2009.07.25, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia