



Empowering Public Council to Curb Government Corruption

Progress report

To Partnership for Transparency Fund

Submitted by Globe International, Mongolian NGO

Project Leader: Kh.Naranjargal

Reported Period: December 1, 2008- April 1, 2009

Project Budget: 25,000 USD

Received: 4,950 US\$

Bank charge: 50 US\$

Expenditure: 6, 615.60US\$

Address: Globe International

Chingeltei duureg. Khoroo No 6, Diplomat 95 Complex, Entrance No1, # 6

Ulaanbaatar, Zip code: 15170, Mongolia

Mailing address: 211238, P .O.B 102,

April 04, 2009, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia

Empowering Public Council to Curb Government Corruption

1. INTRODUCTION

Globe International, a Mongolian NGO has started implementing a project “Empowering Public Council to Curb Government Corruption” since January 1, 2009 under the grant of Partnership for Transparency Fund.

Project’s goal is to assist in empowering Public Council that is able to take remarkable contributions to the ACA duties to curb corruption, and objectives are to create more favorable legal environment and regulation to guarantee an efficient functioning of the Public Council, to promote better cooperation between Public Council, NGOs and other civil society organizations and to encourage the active public participation in curbing corruption

We anticipate that after six months:

- Public Council members and civil society groups educated on the efficient Public Council
- Recommendations on better legislation and rules regulating the Public Council’s efficient functioning produced
- Better cooperation between Public Council, NGOs and other civil society organizations enhanced and strengthened
- The public properly informed on PC existence and their participation increased

The project is implemented by a GI project staff in cooperation with the Public Council of the Anti-corruption Agency of Mongolia. The project formed Public Council Empowering Team (PCET) consisted from three project staff and four other members: two members of the Public Council and representatives of two NGOs: Zorig Foundation and Center of Human Rights and Security.

During the reported period, we have organized in total, six meetings: two three- part meetings, three PCET meetings and one civil society consultative meeting. The project signed the contract with Transparency International- Latvia to hire Aiga Grisane, an expert from to help us to in conducting comparative legal analysis and produce legal recommendations.

We have received 4,950US\$ as the first installment of the grant in December 2008 and the project activities started in January 2009. Total expenditure of the project budget is 6,615US\$

2. INTERIM RESULTS

- PCET consisting from seven members established and held three meetings
- Contract with TI-Latvia signed to involve Aiga Grisane to help in conducting comparative legal analysis and producing two recommendations

- Introduction on the present legal environment for PC functioning produced by local expert and translated into English, and delivered to the international expert
- Regulatory documents including the Anti-corruption law and PC working rules sent to the expert
- In total, 25 people informed in the present PC situation and the project activities through a civil society consultative meeting and contributed their ideas on proper PC and suggested on how to achieve the project objectives
- Press release produced on the CSC meeting and delivered to the media outlets
- Project activities publicized through GI website and three television channels: Mongolian National Public Television, NTV and Channel 25

The project has formed the project staff consisted from 3 persons and Public Council Empowering Team (PCET) that will include the project staff and other four members – representatives of NGOs and PC. Names are below:

Project staff:

Kh. Naranjargal	Project leader
Ch. Munkhzul	Project coordinator

PCET Members:

G. Erdenebat	Chairman of legal sub-council of the Public
Ch.Choisamba	Chairman of educational sub-council of the Public
G.Gerelmaa	Zorig Foundation
M.Sukhbaatar	Human Rights and Security, NGO

3. ACTIVITIES CARRIED OUT

3.1 Three part meetings

The project had the first meeting with the ACA on January 9, 2009 at the ACA meeting room.

Attendees:

- Kh.Naranjargal, project leader, GI
- Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator, GI
- E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman
- Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
- G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
- Sh. Radnaased, Chairman of the Prevention and Education Department, Commissioner
- J.Tumurkhuyag, Officer of the ACA Prevention and Education Department
- J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Two main issues were on the agenda: project introduction and formation of the PCET.

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader thanked the PC and ACA for supporting an initiative of Globe International and their commitment to cooperate on the empowerment of the PC. She introduced the project, its objectives and activities.

Mr. Sh.Radnaased welcomed the cooperation and expressed his hope that the project will take a great contribution to the ACA activities on curbing corruption.

Mr. E.Borlochuluun has offered the two PC sub-council chairmen to include to the PCET. After discussion, the meeting participants agreed to involve Zorig Foundation and Center for Human Rights and Security as far as these NGOs have been active in anti-corruption activities.

Mr. Sh.Radnaased said that the project has come in time because the ACA is trying to build NGO network in the provinces and this project will be valuable in increasing the public participation in anti-corruption affairs and promoting the public education. He also mentioned that the project can invite an expert from Hong Kong who previously has worked in Mongolia.

The meeting agreed to organize the first PCET meeting on January 12, 2009 and discuss the project activities in detail, work out the precise activity schedule and tasks of the PCET members. It also was agreed that J.Tumurkhuyag will be a key person to represent the ACA in the project.

The meeting also agreed that there are no needs to meet every week. The meeting should be held at any time, if it is needed.

The second three part meeting was held at the ACA meeting room on March 13, 2009

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation
D.Dulamsuren, Anti-Corruption Agency
J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Absent: M.Sukhbaatar

The meeting started at 14.00 and the project leader moderated the meeting.

Agenda:

- Introduction of the Latvian expert
- Work plan during the expert's visit: training and 2d CSC meeting

- Exchange of ideas on venue, participants and program
- Content of educational fliers
- Preparations of the one-day training

Full minutes of the two meetings are available in Mongolian. *Attachments No 1.1-1.2*

Discussion:

- The project leader introduced the participants with the expert's CV, profile and contract signed
- Bolorchuluu and Erdenebat should start working with the expert already now because they are lawyers and speak Russian. The project coordinator will send her e-mails to everybody
- We have to decide what the working language is during the events. Russian or English
- We should think and sent our ideas on the training program to the expert. Could it be simple and basic knowledge on the corruption and its types etc or should it be advanced
- All the PC members should be attending the training, so they have to know about the dates and adjust their work schedules
- We should involve some other NGOs because some they want it. These NGOs can be the potential PC members after the termination of the present PC
- Draft legal regulations should be discussed by the 2d CSC meeting
- It is better if the training organized on the second day of the expert's visit and CSC meeting – on the 3d day. PCET members should work together in other days. We should have one day after the events and work together on the recommendations of the CSC meeting
- PCET has to know about their works to be done prior the expert's arrival

The agreed:

- Organize the 4th PCET meeting at 16.00 on March 28, 2009 at GI office
- Contact M.Sukhbaatar and inform the date and venue of the meeting
- PCET members to e-mail the slogans, pictures, calls that they want to see in the fliers
- Start preparations of the events during the expert's visit
- Date is for the training is April 22 and for CSC meeting- April 23

3.2 Public Council Empowerment Team Meetings

Team Meeting 1

The first meeting was held on January 12, 2009 at Globe International office

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman
Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
M.Sukhbaatar, HR and Security, NGO
J.Tumurkhuyag, Anti-Corruption Agency
J.Enkhtuul, PCET Secretary

Full minutes are in Mongolian taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary.

Agenda

- Selection of the second NGO to work in PCET team
- Detailed work plan
- Tasks of the PCET members and draft TOR of the contract
- Inviting an international expert. Criteria and requirements
- The first Civil Society Consultative Meeting: date, venue, list of participants and agenda

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader opened the meeting and she noted that civil society support is very important and the public should know what we do and such project is going on.

The team discussed the project objectives and activities in detail in accordance with the Detailed Working Plan and the present activities of the PC.

The Working Plan was adopted by the PCET members. Attachment No 3

Main issues pointed out:

Tasks of the PCET members

- Take their contribution to make the project most successful and achieve the project objectives
- The members of the PC and NGOs work and GI project staff organises and coordinates the activities
- Strive to make the NGOs and CSOs as our partners, not fight with them. Civil society structure in Mongolia is various and NGOs are different

The present situation of the PC s

- Many PC members are still not aware why they are in the PC. The ACA organised one-day training once on what is corruption and types of the corruption for the PC members and they think it is not enough.
- Some of the PC members had met an expert from Hong Kong and he told about their experiences, but not particular advices how to make the PC more powerful
- The PC activities are very weak, so it is almost nothing to inform the public
- The ACA representative said that they founded NGO networks in 21 provinces and the first training will be held on January 20-22, 2009. They are also planning to organise the regional meetings in three aimags every quarter this year and they are planning to involve the PC members

Potential expert

- Some of the members suggested inviting an expert from Asian country. The Hong Kong expert seemed he is very experienced in controlling the corruption crime, but the Mongolian PC does not have any legal grounds for such works
- The most PCET members preferred having the expert from European country because our educational and historical backgrounds are the same and mentality is very similar. May be Russia or one of the former soviet countries, or from European developed countries or from Eastern European former communist countries

The first Civil Society Consultative Meeting

- It should be in participatory approach, not just lecturing one and others listening
- Presentations should be short and well focused on the topic. Choismba will prepare presentation on the PC goals, objectives, Erdenebat- on the legal regulations and Sukhbaatar on the legal environment on fighting corruption crime because the public should know what legal problems has the ACA in investigating corruption crimes
- It is better to organise the meeting in February
- Draft programme should be developed very soon and PCET members will contribute
- Develop the list of participants carefully and PCET members will contribute

The meeting agreed:

- Invite Zorig Foundation as PCET member because they have active in anti-corruption issues and one of the most ethical NGOs
- Create an e-mail network of the PCET members and the ACA representative
- Seek an expert from TI-Latvia because it is one of the strongest among TI network
- Prepare the legal documents and start translations now
- Project coordinator will draft contract and send to PCET members by e-mail
- Date for the meeting should be re-discussed
- PCET members will send their appropriate time schedules to the project coordinator in order to fix the date
- Project coordinator will produce the agenda for the next meeting and send by e-mail

- Project coordinator will draft the programme based on the discussions here
- Erdenebat, Choisamba and Sukhbaatar will send the concepts of their presentations the mailing list and PCET members contribute their ideas
- Erdenebat will send a short concept paper on what we want from the expert and send the potential expert
- The project leader will start seeking an expert from Latvia via her contacts
- Inform the media in project activities

Team Meeting 2

The second meeting was held on January 27, 2009 at Globe International office.

Attendees:

- Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
- E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman
- Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
- Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
- G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
- M.Sukhbaatar, HR and Security, NGO
- B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation

Full minutes are taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary and available in Mongolian.

Attachment No 4

The project leader moderated the meeting and she welcomed Gerelmaa, a new PCET member representing Zorig Foundation

Agenda:

- Preparation of the first Civil Society Consultative Meeting
- Information on the international expert
- Exchange of ideas on publication of the fliers
- Signing the contract

Preparation of the first Civil Society Consultative Meeting

- By e-mail, it is agreed to hold the first consultative meeting at 14.00 on 6th February of 2009
- Media release should be prepared and posted in GI website
- Two places discussed; The round room of the Mongolian Chamber of Commerce and conference room of the National Legal Center
- Presentations should be ready 3 days prior to meeting to copy. Concepts are ready. Erdenbat and Sukhbaatar will change the titles of their presentations and will send it to the project coordinator tomorrow

- Participants will be formed into groups and discuss their ideas how to make the PC more powerful and suggest us how to achieve our objectives in the most effective ways
- The list of participants agreed by e-mail. Some other people can be added as soon, before we deliver the invitations

Information on the international expert

The project leader informed that she contacted TI-Latvia and she sent the project document and a background paper on need of the expert. She said she hopes the contract will be signed in February. She is drafting the text and TOR of the contract.

Exchange of ideas on publication of the fliers

- Fliers should be in A5 size and 6-8 pages. If we want to put the photos and resumes of the PC, we would need more spaces
- The public should know how to contact the PC. How the ordinary citizens directly contact you? Calling, e-mailing or what else?
- E-mails and names of their work places can be put
- Slogans are important
- Nice picture is important
- PC logo is needed or we can use the ACA logo
- Goals, objectivise, Presidential Decree or what other texts should be put
- How about activity directions?
- Call addressed to the public to curb corruption. Something like Please join us?
- May be, some words like "Power Corrupts and Absolute Power Absolutely Corrupts" or corruption is abuse of power or corruption is social cancer
- We can use children's pictures that got prizes
- We have to discuss it again in details because the PC does not have any office, general telephone etc

Decision

- Signed the contracts Attachments No 5.1-5.4
- Organise the first Civil Society Consultative meeting on February 06, 2009 at the conference room of the National Legal Center
- Launch the PC logo
- Prepare a short introduction on the PC and deliver to the project coordinator within 5 days
- Offer the names and organisations to the list of participants
- Erdenebat, Choisamba, Sukhbaatar will submit their presentations 5 days prior the consultative meeting
- The project staff will provide preparations: refreshments, meals, background materials, room rent etc

Team Meeting 3

The third meeting was held on 18th March of 2009 at Globe International office

Attendees:

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader
E.Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman
Ch.Munkhzul, project coordinator
Ch.Choisamba, PC Sub-council chairman
G. Erdenebat, PC Sub-council chairman
M.Sukhbaatar, HR and Security, NGO
B.Gerelmaa, Zorig Foundation
J.Enkhtuul, team secretary

Minutes were taken by J.Enkhtuul, team secretary and available in Mongolian.

Attachment No 6

Agenda:

- Draft Action Plan
- Adoption of the content of the educational fliers
- Second CSC meeting preparations
- Training preparations

The meeting decided to postpone the discussion of the draft action plan to the next meeting

Decision:

- Content of the fliers approved and the project coordinator will send to the designer
- Gerelmaa will send the photos or paintings to the project manager
- Choisamba will be responsible for the text and he should meet Erdenebat and Sukhbaatar on March 20th and send the materials to the project coordinator on March 25th
- The text and other materials needed for the fliers should be approved within March 28th
- Erdenebat will send his ideas on the training program to Aiga
- Sukhbaatar will find the list of NGO network from the ACA and its contacts
- All members are to bring the list of the suggested participants to the next meeting

3.3 Civil Society Consultative meeting 1

The meeting was organized on February 6, 2009 at the conference room of the National Legal Center. It involved 25 participants represented the Anti-corruption Agency, PC members, National Human Rights Commission and NGOs.

Mr. E. Bolorchuluun, PC Chairman opened and moderated the meeting.

Agenda:

- Introduction on the Public Council of the Anti-corruption Agency
Ch.Choisamba, Chairman of the PC Sub-council on Public Participation and Public Opinion
- The legal environment of PC. Advantages and Disadvantages, and Challenges
G.Erdenebat, PC Sub-council on law implementation and corruption
- The legal environment for fighting corruption crime
M. Sukhbaatar, Human Rights and Security, NGO
- The objectives and activities of the project “Empowering the Public Council to Curb Government Corruption
Kh.Naranjargal, Globe International President and CEO, project leader
- Group Work: How to establish good cooperation and efficient partnership between PC and civil society and to achieve the project objectives?

Discussions:

- National Human Rights Commission is suggesting organising the training “Corruption and Human Rights”. They also think it will be very useful and helpful, if the PC cooperates with the courts, police and the General Authority of the Implementation of the Court Decisions) in organising the meetings and trainings
- Anti-corruption law and other related laws must be changed
- The PC must be active in educating the public and raising their awareness
- The PC must have its groups to carry out permanent activities
- The PC members must have knowledge on the corruption issues and its operation and activities
- Cooperate with the Civil Society Council which is an official network of CSOs and the Government
- Set up more deep connections and relationships with NGOs specially focusing on anti-corruption education, transparency, government bureaucracy and corruption study and research institutions

The project leader asked the participants to think and write down their thoughts “How do you see a proper PC?”

- Initiative and constantly promotes its activities
- Push the ACA to make their goals and objectives reached
- Has good activity plans and strives to achieve its goals and objectives

- Has permanent activities
- Has good partnership with other organisations
- Has favourable legal environment
- Be transparent
- Be powerful
- Has its branches in the provinces
- Takes public control over the ACA activities
- Regularly meets the ordinary people and hear their opinions
- Continuously promotes its activities via media
- Has good financing

In order to make the PC more powerful the participants see the main difficulties faced by the PC as follows:

- No budget to carry out activities
- No permanent office or permanent secretary to coordinate the PC members and its activities
- No good working plan
- No experiences
- No commitment of some PC members
- No awareness of some PC members why they are here and what they should do

Group brainstorming

The participants formed into four groups to brainstorm on how to efficiently work to achieve the project objectives

Outcomes of Brainstorming:

Group 1/Objective 1: Objective: Public Council members and civil society groups educated on the efficient Public Council

- The PC should cooperate with Civil Society Council
- The PC should conduct training for Civil Society Council member organisations
- The PC members should be acquainted with the similar organisations in other countries. Study tours could be efficient
- Publish handbook on the PC goals, activities and importance
- To have its own air time on the public television to educate the public on corruption consequences
- The PC members should be highly educated, so they should enhance their knowledge and skills
- The PC will strive to have good results

- It should be better, if the most of PC members are lawyers

Group 2/Objective 2: Recommendations on better legislation and rules regulating the Public Council's efficient functioning produced

- Make the PC related provision of the Anti-corruption law more clear and include clear and narrow regulations on the PC powers, duties and activities. It must be regulated by law, not the Working Rules adopted by the Presidential Decree
- Include the provision to the Anti-corruption law to guarantee the financial capacity of the PC. It can be included to the ACA budget
- Include the provision to the Anti-corruption law to provide power to take control or supervise corruption crimes and complains of the citizens that are not accepted or annulled by the ACA
- Make amendments to the Anti-corruption law and Criminal Law and include the followings as crimes:
 - ✓ Suddenly get rich
 - ✓ Money laundering
 - ✓ Bank crimes
 - ✓ Include the ACA to the list of powers to access the bank information from the banks
- Enact a law on the conflict of interests or add the relevant provisions to the existing Anti-corruption law

Group 3/Objective 3: Better cooperation between Public Council, NGOs and other civil society organizations enhanced and strengthened

- The PC should have the list of NGOs committed to contribute to the curbing corruption and set up the permanent contact and exchange information
- The PC should have permanent day that NGOs come and exchange information and opinions
- Create NGO network. The ACA is building up such network in the provinces. The similar activities should be carried out in the capital.
- Provide the NGO networks with information and enable to exchange information
- Take control over the local administration budget. The three part contract was signed by the local administration, the ACA and local NGOs. 10% of the total budget of the local administration was allocated for anti-corruption actions and activities
- The PC should have its page in the ACA website and regularly update the information
- Launch the online information network to promote and encourage the public participation

Group 4: The public properly informed on PC existence and their participation increased

- Organise media campaign and cooperate with media to report on the PC activities
- Produce the printed materials educating the citizens on the need and importance of their participation
- The PC members should be able to introduce their works to the public through regular meetings
- The PC should have a structure to receive the public requests and complains.

Please see the program, list of participants, invitations. *Attachment No 7.1-7.3*

3.4 Progress on Regulatory Works

It was agreed to find an expert from Latvia at the PCET team meeting because TI-Latvia is one of the strongest among TI network, Latvia and Mongolia has the same historical background, similar mentality and characters of the corruption crimes.

The project leader approached TI-Latvia and it was agreed to invite Aiga Grisane- lawyer
The contract signed with Laura Mikelsons, TI-Latvia Director.

Please see Aiga Grisane's profile, CV and contract attached. *Attachments No 8.1-8.3*

The expert will work in Ulaanbaatar between 20- 25th of April 2009 and she will:

- Provide the comparative legal framework of the public councils or similar bodies existing in other countries in such as powers, responsibilities and duties, formation (nomination and appointing) and decision-making processes, activities etc.
- Produce the Recommendations on proper PC related provision of the Anti-corruption Law of Mongolia and other regulations.
- Produce the Recommendations on a new draft of Working Rule of PC.
- Assist in drafting and approval of the PC and Civil Society Action Plan to advocate the approval of recommendations
- Produce one-day training program and conduct during her stay in Ulaanbaatar
- Present the reports on the comparative legal studies and the recommendations to the civil society consultative meeting to be held during her stay in Ulaanbaatar
- Propose an evaluation format for activities.

The following materials sent to the expert. Some were translated into English.

- The project document(English)
- The Anti-corruption law of Mongolia (English)
- The Presidential Decree to establish the PC
- The PC Working Rules adopted by the President

- An introductory document on the present legal environment produced by Mr. G. Erdenebat, Ph,D, PC Sub-Council Chairman and Professor of the Law School of the Mongolian State University

Please see the English translations. Attachments No 9.1-9.3

4.5 Progress on “Public Council at Work” campaign

The PCET has developed the content of the educational fliers and it will be available by the 2d CSC meeting to be held in February.

The PCET also has started negotiating with television channels to air four television programs.

Four television channels reported on the first CSC meeting. The media outlets will be encouraged to cover the next events. Please see Press Release that was distributed to the media. Attachment No 10

The project posted the information on the activities to GI web site at www.globeinter.org.mn
Please see the copies of the web news. *Attachments No 10.1-1.3*

4. PROJECT PERFORMANCE

Months	Activities planned	Activities carried	Comments
I	Project preparation: detailed working plan, formation of PCET, meeting with the PC and ACA, contract with international expert, project publicity started	Working plan produced PCET formed and contracts signed. 3 PCET meetings held 2 PCET and ACA meetings held	
II	Relevant documents translated into English, 1 st consultative meeting organized. Preparation of the training and consultative meeting started	Contract with TI-Latvia signed on Feb.18, 2009. 5 documents sent to the expert. Three translated The first CS Consultative meeting held on February 6, 2009 and involved 25 participants	

		Four television channels covered the event	
III	International expert arrived, training and consultative meeting organized. Media covered on the events	Preparations for the trainings and 2d CSC meeting are going on 2 meetings held Content for fliers are available Negotiations with television channels on media campaign started	Expert is able to come in April 2009
IV	3d consultative meeting organized campaign strategy available. Media covered the event		
V	Public campaign started. Fliers distributed production of television programs started. PCET and PC members interviewed by media		
VI	Television programs aired, evaluations taken		

Report by Naranjargal Khashkhuu, project leader

2003.04.03, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia