



CURBING CORRUPTION THROUGH BETTER ACCESS TO INFORMATION

Final Report

(November 15, 2008-March 15, 2009)

Submitted by Globe International

Address: Globe International, NGO Chingeltei duureg. Khoroo No 6, Diplomat 95 Complex, # 1-6, Ulaanbaatar, 15170, Mongolia, Mailing address: 211238, P.O.B 102

Tel: 976 11 32 47 64, 32 46 27

Fax/Tel: 976 11 31 53 26

E-mail: globe@magicnet.mn, globe@globeinter.org.mn, globenews@globeinter.org.mn

Web site: www.globeinter.org.mn, www.monitoring.mn

Project Leader: Naranjargal Khashkhuu, hnaran@globeinter.org.mn



March 2009, Ulaanbaatar

Curbing Corruption through Better Access To Information

Final Report

TITLE

I. Introduction	1
II. Project results/Outcomes	1
III. Project Activities	4
IV. Cooperation/Partnership	14
V. Constraints/Problems	14
VI. Project Performance	15
VII. Project evaluation	15
VIII. Conclusion/Recommendation	18
IX. Website links	22
X. Financial Report	23



We express our deepest gratitude to the Embassy of the Great Britain and North Ireland in supporting our project. Also, our sincere thanks to the Asia Foundation in providing the funds for the training for Speakers of Local Parliaments and our partners: The Office of the Mongolian Parliament, Office of the National Human Rights Implementation Committee, helped us organizing the project events.

Thanks to Civil Society Coalition members: Open Society Forum, DEMO, Voters' Education Center, Press Institute, Human Rights and Development Center, Employers Federation of Mongolia, Zorig Foundation, National Human Rights Programme and Transparency NGO

Final Report

I. INTRODUCTION

Globe International, a Mongolian NGO has completed the four-month project “Curbing corruption through better access to information” under the 20,000 USD grant awarded by the Embassy of Great Britain and North Ireland in Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia. The project ran from November 15, 2008 to March 15, 2009 and it was aimed at curbing corruption through better access to information held by public institutions and promoting transparent and accountable governance.

The objectives of the project were to advocate and lobby legislation on freedom of information and new state secrecy law, and engage civil society to the campaigning.

We anticipate that the Parliament will pass the Law on the Right to Access Information and new State Secrecy Law during the period of their power until 2012.

During the project period, we formed Civil Society Coalition consisted from 10 NGOs and we held five CSC meetings to coordinate our events and advocacy activities. The project organized 9 events including Civil Society Coalition meetings, round table, training and Opinion Exchange Meeting and directly involved 121 individuals to the last three events.

The project cooperated with the Office of the Mongolian Parliament, the Office of the National Human Rights Programme, Anti-Corruption Agency and the Asia Foundation provided the partial funding for the local travels of the Speakers of the local parliaments from 19 aimags

As results of our activities, we have established the Parliament Group to provide the inside lobbying and now the number of the law initiators reached from 4 to 13 MPs. The project activities involved 34% of the Parliamentarians.

During the project implementation we produced four monthly progress reports and financial reports and submitted to the Embassy of Great Britain and North Ireland.

The project fully achieved its planned results and we are committed to continue our works on advocacy and lobbying the FOI law, and public awareness development and public education on access to information issues.

II. PROJECT RESULTS/OUTCOMES

2.1 Planned: To raise awareness and provide education for the MPs, specially for new comers
Achieved:

- New draft law on the Right to Access Information available and distributed to the MPs. It will be submitted to the Parliament. It is in the Spring Session of the Parliament
- 34 laws on the amendments to 34 laws in consistence with the law draft available and it will be submitted to the Parliament. Open Society Forum, CSC member has provided the funding for drafting

- A new Working Group on the state secrecy law established at the State Intelligence Authority
- 76 MPs informed in the concept and principles of freedom of information and international standards, and comparative surveys on state secrecy legislation and the present Mongolian situation, and promises of the Mongolian government through the Handbook for legislators: Freedom of Information”
- 20 MPs and four MP assistants, 14 officials of the Office of the Parliament, Parliament Research Center, two legal consultants Ministries, seven NGO representatives and 15 journalists informed through three types of the educational and promotional materials mentioned below:
 - ✓ 18 types of A3 single copies of posters have been produced and displayed at the meeting. Posters referred to the UN Assembly Resolution No 59 on the freedom of information, results of surveys and studies carried out by GI and the promises of the Mongolian Government to enact the FOI Law.
 - ✓ 30 t-shirts with GI logo and slogan “Freedom of information is an essential human right” (UN Resolution No59, 1946) produced and wore by the project staff, Civil Society Coalition and distributed to some participants
 - ✓ 100 mugs with GI logo and slogan “ Freedom of information as an essential human rights” distributed to the participants of the meeting
 - ✓ 76 MPs received Globe International Trust Message calling them to submit the law draft by May 3 due to the World Press Freedom day

2.2. Planned: To educate the local parliament speakers on access to information issues

Achieved:

- 19 speakers/chairmen of the Aimag citizens’ representative khurals participated in two-day training “Government transparency and Information Openness and gained knowledge on
- 21 speakers/chairmen educated through the Freedom of Information-handbook for legislators (mailed to two chairmens of Tov and Ovorkhangai aimags)
- 21 speakers/chairmen gained knowledge on how to make the access to information process easier at the government institutions through “‘How to?’ document distributed to the training(mailed to two chairmens of Tov and Ovorkhangai aimags)
- 21 speaker/chairmen provided background educational materials prepared for the training(mailed to two chairmens of Tov and Ovorkhangai aimags)

2.3 Planned: To advocate and lobby legislation on freedom of information and new state secrecy law

Achieved:

- 61 persons attended the Opinion Exchange Meeting including 20 members of the Parliament and assistants of four MPs, 14 from the Parliament Office, Parliament Standing Committees, Parliament Research Center and Parliament Group of the democratic Party, two legal consultants of the Ministries, seven NGO representatives and 15 Parliament journalists from 10 print and 5 broadcast media
- Nine Members of the Parliament signed to join the law initiating group that consisted from four MPs at that time
- Six MPs signed to support the laws
- Five MPs promised to respond after they get acquainted with the available draft
- Six Members of the Parliament attended the two Parliament Group meetings

2.4 Planned: To engage civil society to the advocacy and lobby campaigning

Achieved:

- The project formed Civil Society Coalition consisted from 10 NGOs and the members gained knowledge on the draft law concept, draft law, Globe International recommendation to the draft law, expertise on the draft law issued by an international organization Access Info and Article 19, the current situation and promises of the Mongolian government on information disclosure through five CSC meetings and a package for CSC members prepared by Globe International
- 10 CSC members contributed to planning and organizing of the project events
- 49 participants represented NGOs, government institutions and informed in the role of open information in curbing corruption and freedom of information issues through the round table “Corruption and Freedom of Information”
- The entire public informed in the project events and issues discussed through 6666 media coverage: event covered by four daily newspapers (UB Post, Daily News, Century’s News, Mirror of Society) and two biggest Internet portals: Olloo.mn and Gogo.mn before and after the event, and live programme “Let’s talk” of the Mongolian National Public Television on 14 March 2009 at 11.00 pm

Input

- The Globe International project staff consisted from four persons carried out the project activities
- 10 CSC members contributed to all the project activities
- Six NGO representatives have taken presentations for the discussions at the round table

- In total, 15 local trainers and lecturers contributed to the training
- Two Members of the Parliament lectured at the training
- 10 Civil Society Coalition members have taken the presentations at the training
- Three government officials contributed to the training
- Six MPs contributed to two Parliament Group meetings

III. PPROJECT ACTIVITIES

The project organized 9 events including Civil Society Coalition meetings, round table, training and Opinion Exchange Meeting and directly involved 121 individuals to the last three events.

3.1 Civil society coalition meetings

Civil society coalition meeting No1

The project staff prepared a package for CSC members that includes draft law concept, draft law, Globe International recommendation to the draft law, expertise on the draft law issued by an international organization Access Info and info on the current situation and promises of the Mongolian government on information disclose. Annex 1

The first meeting was held on 4th December 2008 at Globe International office and the agenda was as follows:

- Introduction of the project
- How to document preparation
- Engagement to media advocacy
- Assistance in organizing seminar, training and the round table and developing programs and list of participants and take presentations

Civil Society Coalition meeting No 2

The meeting was held on 12 January 2009 at Bishreilt Hotel. The meeting started at 12 p.m. The meeting invited Mr.Janchivdorj, officer of the National Human Rights Programme of the Mongolian Government.

The followings were on the agenda.

1. Introduction on the meeting with MP-law initiators
2. Introduction on the state secrecy legislation reform
3. Draft agenda of the events: MP seminar, round table and training
4. Media advocacy plan

During the discussion the CS representatives agreed to add some topics such conflict of interests, transparency criteria and CS partnership with government. The drafted topics were endorsed and CS coalition members will prepare concept of their presentations.

Globe International is tasked to draft media advocacy plan and invite CS coalition members for media interview

It is agreed to move the MP seminar to March

Naranjargal Kh, project leader informed participants in outcomes of meeting with MPs and state secrecy legislation reform.

Civil Society Meeting No 3

It was held on 2 February 2009 at the Bishreit hotel and it discussed the programme of the training for Chairmen of Citizens' Representative Khurals

The project leader informed the CSC members in that the Asia Foundation has agreed to provide the partial funding for the training because the travel costs are not sufficient. They have found out about the training from Mongol Messenger and invited us to cooperate, so now we have the sufficient fund for travels. The Asia Foundation will develop the programme for their citizens engagement training session.

CSC members discussed and approved the training programme and agreed the following presentations will be taken at the training:

- Need for Freedom of Information, N. Enkhbold, Deputy Speaker of the State Ikh Khural
- Freedom of Information: What is it? Our Promises and International Standards, Kh.Naranjargal, President and CEO, Globe International
- Right to Information in the National Human Rights Programme of the Mongolian Government
D.Janchivdorj, Officer of the NHRP Implementation Committee Office
 - Government Institutions and its Reputation, Kh.Temuujin, MP
 - Transparency in Legislation Process and Information Supply, R.Burmaa, Voters' Education Center
 - Transparency Criteria, D.Tserenjav, Transparency Foundation
 - Income Order. How to Report?, M.Enkh-Amar, Anti-Corruption Agency
 - Conflict of Interests, B.Oyundari, Zorig Foundation
 - Role of Media in Curbing Corruption, M.Munkhmandakh, Director, Mongolian Press Institute
 - Ensuring Public Participation in Public Administrative Decisions and Regulations
B.Khishigaikhan, WB project on standardisation of public administrative regulations
 - Public Participation and Access to Information in Environmental Laws, Ch.Tumenbayar, Human Rights and Development Center
 - Partnership of government and non-government organisations, G.Undral, DEMO
 - Partnership of government institutions state and private sector in fighting corruption, J.Munkh-Erdene, Head of educational and legal division, Employers' Federation of Mongolian

Agreed to send the concepts of their presentations in three days and submit the presentations three days prior to the training

Civil Society Meeting No 4

was held on March 6, 2009 at Bishreht hotel. The following were on the agenda

- Presentation of the new draft law titled Law on the Right to Access Information
- How to organize the seminar for MPs?
- List of the potential MPs who would join to the Parliament Group

Discussions

- Globe International project manager introduced the CS Coalition members with the draft law on the Right to Access Information and focused on the changes such as more narrow regulation to make the information process easier and regimes of exemptions. This is not a final version to submit to the Parliament, but Mr. Monk-Orgil, MP asked to circulate this to MPs during the seminar. The law drafting team also drafted 34 laws on the amendment to 34 laws. We also have met Mr. Zorigtbaatar, lawyer from the State Intelligence Authority and they have established their Working Group to work on the State Secrecy Law and the concept of FOI law is very important. We have provided them with our draft law in the State Secrecy and FOI law draft
- GI project manager informed that it is agreed with Mr. D.Demberel, Speaker of the UIKH and Mr. N.Enkhbold, Deputy Speaker to organise the MP seminar as joint event with the Parliament Office and it is planned on March 11, 2009 at the Government House.

CS Coalition members discussed how to make the seminar more efficient. This time is difficult to engage the Members of the Parliament to the seminar because they are very busy with discussions of the mining issues, Oyu Tolgoi agreements and state budget amendments and so on. Another reason would be that MPs would not like teaching them.

Decision/Outcomes

Civil Society Coalition decided to organize the seminar for MPs as an Opinion Exchange Meeting. Globe International is to seek more efficient and interesting form of the meeting.

In order to have a strong lobbying group in the Parliament it is better and try to enlarge the number of law initiators or propose the selected members to work in the lobbying group

The list of the potential MPs have been agreed

Civil Society Coalition Meeting No5

It was held at the City Cultural Palace and only issue was on the agenda: evaluation of CSC works. Kh. Naranjargal, project leader informed CSC members in the project performance.

Please see the part Evaluation.

3.2 Parliament Group Meetings

The first meeting was held on January 7, 2009 at 15.00 in the Irish Pub.

Attendees: Ts.Munkh-Orgil, delayed MP , S.Oyun, MP, E.Bat-Uul, MP, S.Batbold, MP & Foreign Minister, P.Erdenejargal, Open Society Forum, J. Bayartsetseg, Open Society Forum, Kh.Naranjargal, Globe International

Agenda:

- Current status of Freedom of Information law draft
- Seminar for Members of the Parliament
- Establishment of Parliament Group

Discussion/Agreement

Kh.Naranjargal has introduced the attendees with project and its activities.

Ts. Munkh-Orgil said that according to recommendations of local NGOs and international experts, the information request and responding processes should be more precise. He has learnt the British access to information law, so the law contains very precise regulation and process. He asked the Open Society Forum to help re-drafting the law. Mr. Munkh-Orgil is the key person among law initiators.

S.Oyun said, if there will be changes over 30% of the text of the submitted law draft, it should be re-submitted.

Attendees also discussed the state secrecy legislation reform in connection with adoption of FOI law.

It is agreed to re-draft the FOI law and OSF to provide the financial support. Make the draft available by the mid of February 2007 and re-submit.

In connection with the above, it is suggested to move the planned in January seminar for MP to March 2009.

The attendees have exchanged opinions on election law, necessity of Broadcast law

It also was advised to wait for establishment of the Parliament group because:

- Mr. Munkh-Orgil , the law initiator, an elected MP is not able to sit in the Parliament due to disputes in the election constituency No 25 of the Bayangol district
- New MP will be joining to the law initiators and it would be more appropriate, if the group is established after seminar and re-submission of the FOI law draft

- Access to Information, Article 19
- Johannesburg Principles on National Security, Freedom of Expression and Access to Information
- Freedom of Information and European Union

The second Parliament Group meeting was held on 12th of March 2009 at Bishrelt Hotel at 19.00 pm. The project staff and four MPs (Z.Altai, Kh.Temuujin, L. Gantumur, G.Bayarsaikhan) attended the meeting.

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader has thanked to MPs who joined the law initiating group and expressed her hope that draft law would be submitted to the Parliament by May 3 due to the World Press Freedom Day. She also said that international NGOs mark the International Day of the Right to Know on September 28th.

She also stressed on the following key points:

- Re-drafting FOI law was agreed by meeting of the CSC members with some law initiators. The distributed present draft is the second version which became available on 25th February
- The law drafting team of OSF has also drafted 34 laws on the amendments in to 34 laws.
- The law drafting team learnt the British law on access to information
- There are two main changes: process regulation is narrower and it has chapter on the regimes of exemptions
- Concerns at the moment is regimes of exemptions because the secrecy scope is still very wide
- State Intelligence Agency has established its working group and the group is working on the concept development of the new state secrecy legislation. Globe International has provided its version of the State Secrecy Law drafted by its own team and the present draft. Mr. Bold, chairman of the SIA is abroad and we have agreed to have a meeting upon his return

Outcomes:

- Z.Altai, MP said good law is needed. Some laws restrict the citizens' rights and freedoms, so we must avoid such restrictions
- L.Gantumur, the present drat should be discussed by NGOs again. Open information makes the government more transparent. The public should know what is happening there. It is basic principle of democracy. I have been working to make the use the tax-payers' money as efficient as possible, so access to information is very much related to it
- S.Lambaa said that he has been supporting this law because it is important and he was one of the law initiators of the previous law. State secrecy law should be submitted together, otherwise it will be difficult to go through. It is important that you are working on it.

- Kh, Temuujin, the law will change the culture and public officials should change their mentality. Classification of the information data is the most important work, so we should go ahead

3.3 “Corruption and Freedom of Information” Round Table

The Coalition organized the round table to discuss the present issues and problems in accessing information held by the public institutions.

The round table was held on 30 January 2009 at the conference hall of the Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs. The round table involved 49 participants represented NGOs, government officials, State Intelligence Authority, General Police Authority and Anti-Corruption Agency.

The round table agenda:

- | | |
|---|------------------------------|
| 5. Freedom of Information. Our Promises and International Standards
Kh.Naranjargal, GI | |
| 6. Transparency. We want to know?
Foundation | D.Tserenjav, Transparency |
| 7. Role of Information in Curbing Corruption | B.Oyundari, Zorig Foundation |
| 8. Role of employers in curbing corruption and bribery
Federation | J.Munkh-Erdene, Employers’ |
| 9. Transparency in Law Discussion | R.Burmaa, Voters’ Education |
| 10. State and NGO Partnership | G.Undral, DEMO |

Outputs:

The participants exchanged their opinions in broad corruption issues. They said that corruption is still big and challenging issue in Mongolia and they hope FOI legislation will bring the changes to Mongolia. Specially, they focused on:

- Civil society organisations waiting for the Freedom of information law. It is crucial need in Mongolia. The FOI law
- The FOI law should have narrow regulations and include accountability system
- Civil society organisations and civic movements want more transparency and fight against government bureaucracy, but nothing is changing
- No justice and rule of law in Mongolia. Nice laws are not implemented.

- NGOs have been working actively, but there are almost no results. They have their own strategies, goals and ways to achieve it, but NGOs must be unified and show solidarity to achieve urgent objectives in the society such as FOI law
- Mongolian media must pay more attention to corruption and bureaucracy and reinforce more social discussions
- There should be special actions to push the Parliament to pass this important law
- The anti-corruption agency should monitor the allocation of the public sources
- Legislative process does not have any public engagement, so the Parliament wants to pass the most important laws shortly without noticing NGOs and public
- Elections are very corrupted. The voters are not well informed. The present election system should be immediately changed

3.4 “Government Transparency and Information Openness” - two-days training for the Chairmen of the Citizens’ Representative Khurals

Access to information is crucial issue in the provinces, so the training was designed to project will organize two days workshops to educate the speakers of local parliament from 21 provinces, so they would be able to distribute their knowledge to the local administration officials.

The training was aimed to educate the capacity of the local leaders on access to information concept and principles and provide tools to make the public information service more efficient at local levels. Objectives of the training were to provide knowledge on:

- Access to information need and legislative reform and transparency criteria
- Promote the public participation and engagement to the everyday activities of the Citizen’s Representative Khurals
- Build up capacity for effective cooperation and partnership of the citizens and local khurals and administration in fighting corruption
- Provide knowledge on the ways that local government officials can best respond to requests for information from the public.

The training organised on 17-18 February 2009 at Bishreilt hotel and involved 19 chairmen of the Citizens’ Representatives Khurals from 19 aimag. Chairmen of Tov and Ovorkhangai aimags were not able to participate in the training.

Kh. Naranjargal, Globe International President and CEO opened the training and D.Munkhburen project coordinator introduced the participants with the project objectives and activities.

Mr. N.Enkhbold, Deputy Speaker of the State Ikh Khural opened the training and he focused on the need of freedom of information legislation. He stressed on the need of freedom of information legislation and Parliament is keen to discuss the law during their power.

During the training the participants learnt better understanding and knowledge on:

- What is freedom of information, international standards, government promises and the existing draft laws and cultural change
- Objectives of the National Human Rights Programme of the Mongolian Government to ensure the citizens' right to information
- What is honour and reputation, do it apply to the public institutions and how should the public institutions serve the public
- Transparency in legislation process and how to engage the public to this process and how to supply information
- Transparency Criteria
- How to report on the income
- What is conflict to interests and how to avoid it

In morning of February 18, 2009, Citizens engagement training was conducted by the Asian Foundation and it educated the participants on general concept and an principles of the citizens' engagement, environmental partnership and citizens' engagement in mining license procedure and conflict management and strategies

The afternoon session of the day devoted to:

- Role of media in curbing corruption, media integrity system
- Public engagement to the public administrative decisions and regulations
- Public participation and access to information in environmental laws
- Partnership of government and non-governmental organisations
- Partnership of state and private sector in fighting against corruption

We used LCD projector, computer, white board and flip charts for the training and distributed three handbooks and the educational materials.

3.5 Opinion Exchange Meeting with the Members of the Parliament

The Coalition organized the Opinion Exchange Meeting on March 11, 2009 from 13.30 to 17.00 at Conference Hall "E" of the Government House. The meeting was organized in cooperation with Office of the Ulsyn Ikh Khural (the Parliament)

It was a continued process designed so that single MP could come at any time and listened to the CS Coalition members and exchanged opinions and asked questions.

The posters displayed on tables, so MPs and other comers can go along and read the texts and take notes. CSC members also were available to explain or give more information and answer the questions. The project staff prepared a package for the MPs which contained the handbook on Freedom of Information, a trust message, a mug and the law draft and it distributed to the participants. To those MPs who could not join to the meeting, we sent the materials next day by the Parliament post.

The project staff contacted MPs through e-mail, invitations, mobile phone and SMS.

Outcomes

Mrs. Arvin, MP was in Hentii aimag, when we reached her. She apologized that she is not able to come to the meeting, but she is supporting FOI law. She also said she always trust GI and their works are right and good.

The first guest was Mr. Z. Altai, who is former director of Channel 25. He asked about need of the law and focused on the results of the surveys and studies carried out by Globe International from 2002- 2007. Finally, he signed to be one of the law initiators.

Some comments of MPs are below:

P.Altangerel: I will read the law draft and meet the law initiators. I have my certain position on this law. I am supporting it. May be, I would join to the law initiating group

N. Batbayar: Activities of the state institutions must be open to the public. Only word is not sufficient, so it must be legislated. Media also must have reliable sources of information. I will read the draft

S.Lambaa: I have this draft and noticed that some ideas have been changed. State secrecy law is very wide. A lot of things are protected by this law. I will be remaining in the law initiating group

L.Gantumur: You should tell to Mr. Munkh-Orgil that I will be in the law drafting group. It is very important law

G.Bayarsaikhan: Information is basics of the democracy and existence of the state. Any organization and any official must provide the information requested by the public

J.Sukhbataar: Content of law is right. My impression is it still needs to be improved and it is related to other laws. For instance, it is very important that law on the administrative processes is convenient to this law. In general, our laws are bad on the processes

Ts.Enkhbold: The main problem is state secret issues. There are two different concepts. My position is to define the state secret and leave open other information. I see this law lacks some terminations. The law initiators should re-call their submitted law version and submit the new one. I will be in the law initiating group

Ya. Batsuuri: State activities must be transparent and information must be open, while private data must be well protected

J.Batsuuri: I am supporting this law because if we get this law enacted, it will make the activities of the state institutions more transparent and information on state officials more open and it will be very important to fight bureaucracy, corruption and bribes

S.Gonchigdorj: The first media law is good. Sometimes narrow regulations strict the rights and freedoms. Our journalists become guilty because they obtain information and distribute it to the public. Journalists must not take responsibility for obtaining information. If information is confidential, it must be protected and those, who are obliged to protect it, must take the responsibility. I will not sign anything now. I have to first learn the draft.

The meeting continued until 17 pm

IV. COOPERATION/ PARTNERSHIP

The project cooperated with the National Human Right Programme of Mongolia in organizing the round table and the training. The Asia Foundation and Anti-Corruption Agency joined to the training of the Chairmen of Aimag Citizens' Representative Khurals.

The Opinion Exchange Meeting was organised in cooperation with the Office of the Parliament.

V. CONSTRAINTS/PROBLEMS

During the project implementation we faced the following constraints and the problems were solved:

Problem: Mr. Munkh-Orgil, an elected MP is the key person in FOI and State Secrecy Legislation. He had been as Chairperson of the Legal Standing Committee of the Parliament and Minister of Justice and Home Affairs. He has been involved to FOI from 2001. Unfortunately, his power was not approved by the General Election Commission because of disputes in the election constituency No 25 of the Bayangol district. It created very skeptical and critical condition to the project.

Solved: Mr. Munkh-Orgil's mandatory of MP approved in the middle of the project and it helped to move the project ahead

Problem: Travel costs for 21 speakers of the local parliaments budged as 1,200USD, but it has increased up to nearly 5,000,000 MNT. It was a danger that we supposed to be not able to bring the people from the remote western aimags.

Solved: The Asia Foundation provided the lacking funds for the travel costs to bring the Chiarmen of the Aimag Representative Khural to the training. The Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs provided free training room and technique.

Problem: It was difficult time to engage the MPs to the seminar because they were very busy with Standing Committee meetings and meetings with the Parliament groups of the political parties to discuss the issues related to Oyu Tolgoi agreement, budget amendmen due to the financial crisis and etc.

Solved: We changed the form of seminar into Opinion Exchange Meeting, which is very new lobbying form in Mongolia and succeeded directly involving 20 MPs

VI. PROJECT PERFORMANCE (Performance report is attached)

Activities	Schedule for	Level of Achievements	Comments
Project start, detailed work schedule, media release, formation of CS coalition and established the Parliament Group	Month 1	Fully	By consultation with the law initiators at the first meeting in January, it was agreed to move establishment of the Parliament Group to month No 4. Group is available now
Coalition meetings held. Preparations of handbook for legislators and Seminar for MP started. Civil society round table held	Month 2	Fully	CSC team decided to move the training to the month 3 and the seminar to Month 4
Coalition meetings held. A seminar for MPs held. Handbook printed and distributed to MPs	Month 3	Fully	
Workshops organized. Lobbying is continued. Start preparing final report	Month 4	Fully	

VII. PROJECT EVALUATION

The project staff and CSC team provided the internal evaluation of the project.

Evaluation forms distributed to 19 participants and 18 received. 94.5% of respondents said that the training was excellent (16.7) and good (77.8) while one person (5.5%) thinks it was average. No one said it was bad.

38.9% of the respondents said that organization of the training was excellent and 55.6% -good, and one person assessed it as average. 94.4% said the training room was nice, 72.2% found the lunch was good and rest think it was average (16.7) and bad (11.1)

Nearly 50% of participants did not satisfied with hotel and 27.7% liked the hotel. All said the techniques and other supplies were excellent. 11.1% of participants found the training materials were excellent and 88.9%- good.

Training topics

Topics	Excellent	Good	Average	Bad
1.Freedom of Information: Our promises and international	16.7	83.3		
2.Right to information in National human Rights Programme	11.1	72.2	16.7	
3.Honour and government Institutions	38.9	55.6	5.5	
4.Transparency in Legislation Process and Information Supply	11.1	72.2	16.7	
5.Transparency Criteria	11.1	66.7	27.8	
6.Income Order: How to Report?	5.5	83.3	11.1	
7.Conflict of Interests	5.5	72.2	16.7	5.5
8.The AF: Citizens engagement training	33.3	72.2	11.1	
9.Role of Media in Curbing Corruption	11.1	72.2	16.7	
10.Ensuring Public Participation in Public Administrative Decisions and Regulations	11.1	66.7	22.2	

11.Public Participation and Access to Information in Environmental Laws	5.5	44.5	50.0	
12.Partnership of government and NGOs	5.5	77.8	16.7	
13.Partnership of government institutions state and private sector in fighting corruption	11.1	44.5	27.8	16.7
14. Need for FOI legislation	72.2	27.8		
15. Crime Prevention Council Activities	77.8	22.2		

100% of the participants said that training materials provided by the project are very important.

94.5% of respondents think such trainings are needed while one person said there is no need.

On 11 March 2009, three MP were abroad, one member was at hospital and one was in the countryside.

- The project planned to engage 10 MPs to the Parliament Group and provide inside lobbying to pass the FOI Law and new State Secrecy Law.

We succeeded in engaging nine more members who signed to join the law initiating group and 6 Mps signed to support the law, so we think it is sufficient for inside lobbying

- The project planned to educate at least 15 MPs through direct attendance in the seminar

The meeting directly involved 20 members and four MP assistants

The project staff used the following ways of communication to contact MPs.

E-mailing

The project staff prepared a letter to MPs and e-mailed to each MP. Only reply was received from Mr. Amarjargal who informed that he was not able to come, but his assistant came to the meeting. In our opinion e-mailing is not considered to be the best way because it was not clear, if they opened and read the messages.

Invitation

The project staff produced the invitations and the Parliament Office distributed to each MP. Calling approved MPs received the invitations.

Calling

The project staff called to each member and managed to directly talk to 22 MPs and they had promised to come, but only eight came. Telephone calls to 10 MP assistants brought three MPs.

Messaging

The project staff had sent SMS to those who did not able to discuss the present issues and problems in accessing information hold by the public institutions. One member sent the message confirming his attendance.

We think all tools of communications were useful because the others who came to the meeting received information on the event from their e-mails or SMS.

Civil Society Coalition met on 13th March 2009 at the meeting room of the City Cultural Palace. Project leader has reported on the project performance and CSC members have discussed the results of their works. The main conclusion was that project achieved its objectives and they also learnt a lot about freedom of issues while working in the team.

Outcomes:

- The project was short , but it was productive, specially March 11th meeting was interesting and new form of lobbying
- We have string Parliament group, so we hope the law will be enacted. if it would not be passed by the Parliament Spring Session, it is hoped that it will be passed by this Parliament within their power
- We should continue our activities to advocate the law, educate the public officials and the public
- We should organize the public discussions or public hearing before and during the Parliament discussions

VIII. CONCLUSION/RECOMENDATIONS

Conclusion

The project achieved its objectives planned in the proposal.

The project managed to directly lobby 34% of the MPs. FOI law new draft is available and the law discussion is on the Spring Session of the Parliament. However, there two concepts among the MPs:

- First, to enact the FOI law and make the State Secrecy law consistent to FOI principles
- First, to amend the State Secrecy Law and enact the FOI law

We feel this kind of discussions may delay the law enactment, so civil society involvement is very important. As on the main results of the project is the project created a team of committed NGOs to continue the lobbying the law, so we hope the MPS will rely our expertise and experiences.

The training for the local leaders was an important and significant element of the project. Training went smoothly without any serious constraints. Participants were active and committed to learn.

The evaluation showed that we achieved our goal and objectives and participants well informed in freedom of information, corruption and public engagement issues. The participants were satisfied with the training and they gained good knowledge during the training.

During the training, we have learnt that there is a need for further training on awareness development and attitude change of the local leaders. For example, some participants think we should have the same understanding. We are not well aware of this, but according to the discussions and questions, we would guess that not all of them are aware of the democratic values, concept and principles and it is hard for them to recognise the international standards. Many of them are still very much confident that state must have its secret in broad, some of them think they are state officials, so they must be respected. Some of them also think that private sector/ business groups force the government officials to get corrupted. They also think that international standards do not suit to the Mongolian conditions and blamed the lectures they too much talk about on foreign experiences and do not focus on the local circumstances. During the training more discussions and arguments appeared at sessions where the trainers touched issues of the government corruption. Some of participants were very emotional and they aggressively responded to critics addressed to government and its officials. It relates to the topics: Conflict of interests and Partnership of government institutions and private sector in fighting corruption. Some of the chairmen think the trainers attacked the State and insult the government officials. Only these topics assessed as BAD in evaluation forms.

Evaluation results show that they are willing and committed to cooperate with NGOs because the most of participants invited us to conduct the similar trainings in their aimags

The participants suggested us to organize the following trainings:

- Organise the similar trainings at regional and local levels
- Organise the trainings for the rural people
- Organise the training of trainers
- Organise the trainings for local leaders and decision makers

They want more trainings on:

- Concentration/Neutralisation
- Strengthening self-governance
- Regional development
- Independency of the aimags
- Citizen's engagement and management plan
- Training on laws and regulations which are not appropriate and contradictory to the real life

They want us to pay more attention to:

- Training quality
- The same understanding
- Selection of trainers depending the audience
- Consultation on the training programme with participants prior to the training

Recommendations:

- To continue working on lobbying through media and individual meetings with the MPs
- To continue civil society coalition activities on reinforcing social dialogue
- To encourage the Parliament Group to work inside the Parliament
- To promote civil society discussions on the draft law and cooperate with the Parliament in organizing the public hearing
- To support the initiatives of the State Intelligence Authority on state secrecy legislation reform and increase the public participation in the process
- To support the local parliaments and local administrations to open the public information at lowest levels such as bahgs and soums
- To organize the training for the public officials and the citizens

Final Report by Naranjargal Khashkhuu, project leader

18th March 2009, Ulaanbaatar

List of the project staff

Kh.Naranjargal, project leader

D.Munkhburen, project coordinator

J. Enkhtuul, project assistant

J.Enkhjargal, financial controller

List of Civil Society Members

J.Bayartsetseg, Open Society Fourm

M.Munkhmandakh, Press Institute

Undral, DEMO

Tumenbayar, Human Rights and Development Center

Munkh-Erdene, Employers' Federation of Mongolia

Janchivdorj, National Human Rights Progamme

Oyundari, Zorig Foundation

R.Burmaa, Voters' Education Center

H.Narantseteseg, Globe Interntional