



MONGOLIA: SUPPORTING SELF-SUSTAINABILITY OF COMMUNITY RADIOS

FINAL REPORT



2013.01.10

Mongolia: supporting self-sustainability of community radios

Final report

Title

I.	Project Introduction	3
II.	Project Results	3-6
III.	Project Activities	6-13
IV.	Project Evaluation	13-15
V.	Problems/Constrains	15-16
VI.	Project Sustainability	16-17

Appendix

Financial report



Mongolia: supporting self-sustainability of community radios

Final report

I. Introduction

Globe International, a Mongolian NGO has completed a nine-month project entitled "Mongolia: supporting self-sustainability of community radios" implemented from April, 2012 till December, 2012 under the funding of Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC).

The project's goal was to promote sustainability of community radios through enhanced community participation and institutional capacity building of professional association of community radios that is able to advocate and defend the rights and common interests of community radios.

The project targeted 10 community radio stations in the most remote soums of Huvsgul, Khovd, Bayan-Ulgii and Uvs aimags and decision makers at the national level. The project implemented by Globe International NGO project team consisted of three persons lead by Kh.Naranjargal, President and CEO of Globe International.

One of the main results of the project was an establishment of the Community Radio Association of Mongolia (CRAMO) which has its strategy and has ability to raise the funds for further activities.

The total project budget was 40,001,800 MNT and total expenditure is 40,006,361.9 MNT. Globe International NGO contributed to provide working place, communication facilities and computer to the CRAM executive director. As the first and second installments, we received in total 36,000,000 MNT from the SDC and now it is to be invoiced 4,000,000 MNT.

Globe International has submitted the Progress report to the SDC on 31 August, 2012 and the present report includes the detailed financial report and attachments documenting the events and activities.

II. Project Results

The project achieved its immediate objectives:

Objective 1:

To assist in establishment of community radio association and build institutional capacity of the newly born organization which is able to advocate to achieve the specific objectives and assist in building networking at local, national and international level

Result

The community radio association of Mongolian (CRAMO) established by 10 community radios and registered. The board consists of 7 members, The Board mebers involved to the fundraising and strategy development workshops. The CRAMO Board members conducted two studies: What is community media and its difference from the public media and presented to the advocay seminar organised in cooperation with Globe International and the UNESCO.

http://www.communityradio.mn/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=75&It emid=112&lang=mn

http://www.communityradio.mn/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=77&Ite mid=115&lang=mn

Objective 2:

To raise awareness of the relevant stakeholders in the society through reinforcing the political commitment to support community radios, to define and defend policies to develop community radios

Result:

The policy seminar held and involved 28 participants including the Government representative who had an opening remark. The Mongolian practices of the community media, organised the advocacy meetings with 7 representatives of the President's Office, The Parliament and the Communications Regulatory Committee (CRC) and the American lawyer Dan Byron from the Interntional Senior Lawyer project, New York. The public informed in through national media

http://globeinter.org.mn/?cmd=Record&id=1017&menuid=406

http://www.olloo.mn/modules.php?name=News&file=article&sid=1217633

http://www.ugluuniisonin.mn/component/content/article/58-2012-02-09-07-20-14/1262-

2012-12

http://toim.orloo.info

http://www.shuud.mn

Objective 3:

To offer opportunities for community radios to share information, knowledge and experiences and indentify the common problems and learn the multi media skills

Result:

Each manager of the 10 community radios introduced in the situation of their radios, programs produced, funds raised and stressed on their strengthens and weaknesses, local

support and problems and challenges. The project purchased 9 cell phone modems for the CRs and organised the one-day multi-media training.

Objective 4:

To build skills of the radio managers to work with community and engage them to radio activities through tranings, meetings and deliver their voices

Result:

10 community radio managers involved in total four-days training and educated on the radio management and sustainability by engaging their communities.

Information on the training available at:

http://www.communityradio.mn/index.php?option=com content&view=article&id=74&It emid=86&lang=mn

2.1. Project Output:

- The community radio concept and its support reflected in the draft National program to support the citizens participation and direct democracy which will be adopted by the Parliament
- o Bylaw of the CRAMO adopted by the founders meeting of CRAMO
- o The CRAMO draft strategy is available and discussed by the Board
- www.communityradio.mn website newly launched in Mongolian and English text is available
- o The UNESCO handbook "Community Media: Good practices" printed in 500 copies
- The training program on community radio sustainability by the community engagement available and can be used for further trainings for the new CRs
- Some relevant international documents such as the OSF's CR managers' handbook, the AMARC Democratic legislation principles for the community broadcasting translated and used for the trainings and seminars
- The Call to the Government adopted the policy seminar participants delivered
- o Five production plans of the community engagement programs available
- 10 community radio managers obtained knowledge on the children participation, curbing corruption, democratic elections civil education, public health and protection of environment as financial sustainability
- Three project ideas available as result of the fundraising workshop. The UNESCO grant secured to support the legal advocacy and organize the review trips to 10 CR locations
- o Two studies available to use for the further advocacy

2.2. Project Input:

- o Globe International's three staff members contributed to all the project activities
- Globe International's Lawyer elaborated the draft bylaw and other documents for the Founders' meeting
- In total, 6 CRAMO board members and the executive director developed strategy and action plan
- 12 local trainers conducted four day trainings
- 10 community radio managers contributed to the founders' meeting, policy seminar and discussions to identify the main challenges and problems
- o 5 local experts took presentations to the policy seminar
- o Two CRAMO board members contributed to the studies

III. PROJECT ACTIVITIES:

Over nine-month Globe International carried out the following two inter-related activities:

- i) Assisting in Establishment of the Community Radio Association and Raising Public Awareness
- ii) Enhancing the Community Engagement

3.1. Assisting in Establishment of the Community Radio Association and Raising Public Awareness

3.1.1 Policy Seminar "Community Media: Today and Tomorrow"

The half-day policy seminar was held May 31, 2012 at conference hall of the National Legal Institution. This half-day seminar was aimed at raising awareness of the decision makers, politicians and civil society on need for legislation and constructive support for disseminating ideas and principles, of community radio and their sustainability. The seminar was attended by more 30 representatives of the community radio, government, the CRC, Radio and Television Network Authority, journalism professors, Informal education center, media and human rights' NGOs.

Mr. P.Zorigtbaatar, senior referent of the Government of Mongolia took an opening remark and he said "Establishment of 10 community radios in the most remote soums was a part of the Mongolian government project «Comprehensive community services to improve human security for the rural disadvantaged populations in Mongolia» supported the United Nations Trust Fund for Human Security. Concept of the community radio is very new in Mongolia" and stressed "The community media is very new concept in Mongolia.

Community media is for the community development, so it is also an interest of our government and necessity of our society"

The following presentations:

- "Community Media: Reality and Challenges" Kh.Naranjargal, President of Globe International
- "Present situation of the existing community radios", Ch.Enkhbayar, Globe International
- Best practices and action, K.Nurlibek, manager of community radio "Uushigtyn tsuurai" radio of Bayannuur, Bayan-Ulgii aimag,
- "Technical support, service of community radio", Temuugee, ingeneer of the Radio and Television network Authority
- "Principles of democratic legislation of community radio", D.Munkhburen, lawyer, Globe International NGO

The participants approved the Call and it was delivered to the government.

Please see the program, presentations, list of participants, the Call and press release.

Attachment # 1.1-1.5

The event covered by Odriin Sonin, daily newspaper, TV5 channel, four news websites: olloo.mn, shuud.mn, olgooniisonin.mn and Globe International website.

3.1.2 Founders' Meeting and the CRAMO actions

Drafting bylaw of the CRA of Mongolia

Globe International lawyer drafted the bylaw of the CRAMO and it was adopted by the Founders' meeting mentioned below.

Founders' Meeting

The founders meeting held on May 31, 2012 at Conference hall of the National Legal Institute. The Founders' meeting was moderated by Kh.Naranjargal, GI head and it consisted of two parts: approval of the bylaw and election of the President, Vice President and other five board members, and Board of Trustees. Globe International coordinated all the preparations and documents such as program, working rules and an open announcement of the candidates for the Board.

The Founders of the CRAMO are:

- Globe International, NGO
- Tolbo nuur, Bayan-Ulgii, Tolbo
- Hultsootiin tsuurai, Bayan-Ulgi, Buyant

- Uushigtyn tsuurai, Bayan-Ulgii, Bayannuur
- Ulaanhusyn dolgion, Bayan-Ulgi, Ulaankhus
- Shishigtiin duu khooloi, Khovsgol, Ulaan-Uul
- Taigyn ayalguu, Khovsgol, Tsagaannuur
- Khotgoidyn ayalguu, Khovsgol, Tsagaan-Uul
- Tavan tesin dolgion, Uvs, Tes
- Uguumur ayalguu, Uvs, Zuungobi
- Bodonchiin dolgion, Khovd, Altai

During the police seminar we announced an open call to the participants to express their wishes to work in the CRAMO board and lately, we received three interest submissions and it appeared in the list of the candidates.

Election results are:

President of CRAMO Ts.Ouyntungalag, Public Radio

Vise President: Ch.Enkhbayar, Globe intertanional

Board members: Z.Amgalan, The CRC

J.Ariungerel, Public Radio

K.Nurlibek, "Uushigtyn tsuurai" radio, manager S.Amartuvshin, State University of Education,

journalism teacher

V.Bat-Erdene, chief of information section of the

National Legal Institute

Board of Trustees: B.Togtokhsuren, officer of CRC

S.Javzansuren, teacher of 'Tsetsee gun' Kh.Narantsetseg, Globe International

Please see adopted bylaw, meeting minutes and decisions. Attachment # 2.1-2.4

The CRAMO officially registered on November 30, 2012 and opened its bank account and located in Globe International office until they get more supports from donors and national companies.

The position of the executive director announced openly through "Daily news", daily newspaper and GI e-marketing system. The CRAMO appointed its executive director D.Munkhburen by the board meeting of September 28, 2012.

• Development of Strategy and Action Plan of the CRAMO

The strategy workshop was organized on 13 December, 2012 by Sh.Gankhuyag, PhD, management consultant. The Globe International staff joined the workshop to help the CRAMO Board and EC to develop the strategy. Later, the CRAMO board discussed the draft strategy and action plan.

The process of recruitment influenced in lingering some CRAMO activities, so the capacity building workshops and strategy development carried about in December 2012. However, necessary skills are in place.

Please see the presentation, participant's list and strategy plan. Attachments # 3.1-3.3

• Fund raising workshop

The workshop was conducted on December 6, 2012 by Kh.Naranjargal. Seven participants each of the participants including GI staff individually came out with their own project proposals and developed it during the workshop. The CRAMO developed the project ideas on strengthening capacity of community radios

Please see the presentation, list of participants and outcomes. Attachments # 4.1-4.3

Advocacy meetings

Two advocacy meetings held on 28 September, 2012 in the Modern Nomads restaurant and on November 30, 2012 in Bavaria restaurant. The advocacy meetings aimed to lobby the relevant stakeholders in developing policy to support the community radio by giving clear understanding of community radio and further cooperation.

The meetings involved:

- Ch.Sosormaa, Adviser of human rights and citizen participation, President of Mongolia
- o Ch.Unurbayar, Legal Advicer of President of Mongolia
- o D.Ganzorig, Adviser of Speaker of Parliament of Mongolia
- o G.Uyanga, Member of Parliament of Mongolia
- o A.Ganbaatar, Referent, President of Mongolia
- o B.Boldbaatar, Head, Office of Parliament of Mongolia
- o Ch.Oyungerel, the CRC
- o Dan Byron, the ISLP, New York

The CRAMO and GI staff provided information on introduction of community radios, what it is, why it is important, why closely linked democracy and direct participation and need for enabling legal environment of community radio.

Outcomes of the meetings:

- It was very timely because the CRC is working on the draft broadcast legislation and it was agreed to involve a representative of the CRAMO or GD to the law drafting working group
- The President's Office is finalizing the draft National Program on Citizens' participation and direct democracy and it was agreed to advocate the President's working group to include the community radio as an efficient tool of citizens' participation. Now, the draft document has this provision and the Parliament will adopt the program.

Please see the concept paper and presentations delivered to the advocacy meetings and short minutes. Attachments # 5.1-5.2

• <u>Launch of website in Mongolian and English in order to start local and international networking and cooperation.</u>

The project helped the CRAMO to launch its web site and it is available at www.communityradio.mn. Web site was developed by Infocon, ICT company.

In order to offer the community radios to use and contribute to the web site, Globe International organized one-day multi-media training for the radio managers and bought the Internet modems.

The training was held on 30 May, 2012 in the computer room of the Press Institute of Mongolia. Trainers Sh.Otgonbaatar and T.Zandmaa from the public radio of the MNB educated the CR manager on how to use internet, open e-mail address, email sending, file attaching, file zipping, gogo sharing, how to use internet modem and information searching and downloading.

Community Media: Good practices handbook

CRAMO and GI translated the UNESCO handbook with the UNESCO, Beijing support and it was printed by this project in 500 copies.

Two studies

Two board members of the CRAMO conducted the studies: What is community radio and what is difference from the public media and Community radio in Mongolia: Present situation and Trends. The first study focused on terminology, concept and translation of the community radio and the second describes the history of the community radio in Mongolia and further actions to develop the community broadcasting

Please see the reports. Attachments # 6.1, 6.2

3.2. Enhancing the Community Engagement

3.2.1 Training on Community engagement and experience learning tour

Globe International organized four-day trainings for 10 community radio managers from 28 May to June 1, 2012 in the Bishrelt Hotel.

On May 28, 2012, in the morning session, the radio managers shared their experiences with each others as following issues:

- Which kind of programs and fund raising activities since establishment?
- The main for weaknesses and strengths
- Techniques, human recourse, support of local governance
- Main challenges and struggles
- How cooperated with ordinary citizens

The participants worked in the groups and discussed the common problems they face:

The identified common problems are:

- 1. Legal environment:
- No laws and regulations
- Registration is very bureaucratic and complicated
- License does not belong to the NGOs/CRs
 - 2. Local support:
- No awareness what is community radio
- No political commitment
- No supports, so CRs have difficulties to cover their operational costs such as heating, rentals, electricity etc
 - 3. Techniques:
- Technical support is provided by the Radio and TV Network Authority and it is not clear what will happen after they stop it
- Receivers: lack of radio sets and need for loud speakers
- Coverage limitation. In the places with high mountains the citizens are not able to listen to radio
 - 4. Personnel:
- Need for continued trainings
- Lack of volunteers
- No salaries for staff
- More trainings needed
 - 5. Funding:
- No sustainable resources

- No financial support from the local governments
- No donations from the citizens because lack of awareness
 - 6. No citizen participation
 - 7. No good programs

Later, this list of the issues presented to the policy seminar and discussed.

In the afternoon, we invited the guests from the World Health Organization, Khan bank foundation and Business Incubation Center to discuss the possible cooperation.

One and half-day training on community engagement

Globe International organized one and half-day training that consisted of three main areas: public education concepts, production of the public education and community engaging programs on radio and financial management including proposal writing.

The experienced trainers from the NGOs and public organizations educated the participants on human rights, legal education, anti-corruption, public health, children participation, democratic election and protection of environment. The training also involved topics such as how to work with the communities, how to produce the civic engagement programs and how to make audios using the printed educational materials by B.Onon, GI staff.

The training discussed the budget issues of the community radios and J.Enkhjaral, GI accountant taught how to produce the budget and prepare the financial report. Kh.Naranjargal, GI conducted proposal writing session. S.Javzandulam, professor from Tsetsee Gun College lectured on how to produce the commercial spots for radio and types of commercials etc.

• Experience-learning tour

The project organized the experience learning tour for 10 community radio managers to the public radio and the family radio FM104.5. During the tour to the MNB, radio managers learnt experiences of producing "Daily color", morning program, "Day's news" live program and they were interviewed by "Bolomj" program.

B.Sansarmaa, program director of Family radio FM104.5 guided the tour for the CR managers and introduced with organizational chart, equipment, activities and how to cooperation with volunteers, development of program strategy. They also discussed further cooperation opportunity with local community radios.

During the training, the managers practiced to develop the plans of such programs and community events.

Programs and presentations attached to the Progress report

• Assistance in a launch of programs and dialogue with the community for sustainable radio and seeking support from communities

During the trainings mentioned above, the managers discussed the possible programs of public education and community engagement. 10 community radio managers offered to develop the production plans and get the financial support for the productions. The project also had component to support will help the community radios to promote its activities via traveling to the baghs and organizing the community events.

The contracts between Globe International and community radios were signed on June 1, 2012 to render the tasks until December 1, 2012. In accordance with the contracts, each soum radio should have been produced in total 40 programs: 20 public education and 20 programs engaging the citizens. Unfortunately, GI has received the production plans from six radios and they got the first installment of the funding which is 80% of the total grant an eq. 488,000 MNT for each soum. The production plans for the public education programs mainly focus on the public health, environment and education. It also includes the topics such as democratic election, the right to know etc.

Uushigtyn Tsuurai community radio of Bayannuur soum of Bayan-Ulgii aimag promoted its activities through cultural event on the occasion of its first anniversary inviting the music groups from the aimag. Community radios of Buyant soum of Bayan-Ulgii aimag and Tsagaan Uul soum of Khuvsgul aimag reported they travelled to the baghs to promote their radios.

Please see the production plans of the community radios. Attachments # 7.1-7.6

IV. PROJECT EVALUATION

4.1 Training evaluation

In order to measure the success of trainings, we distributed the evaluation forms to the training participants. We received 10 completed forms. In accordance with evaluation results, 100 percent of respondents said that organization of the training was good. The most liked were organization, training room and equipment used for the trainings.

70% of the participants evaluated the d<u>uration of the training is appropriate</u> and 10% said it is too long while 20% said it is too short.

60 percent of the managers found that experience learning tour to the public radio and Family radio FM104.5 was the most useful and 50 percent liked the multi-media training.

Concerning the topics of the trainings, 80- 100 percent of the managers said all the topics were excellent or good. See the table below:

Which topic of the training was more interesting?

			Evaluation				
Nº	Topic	Trainer	Excellent	good	average	bad	worst
1.	Children's participation	A.Otgonchimeg	2	8	0	0	0
2.	Democratic election	S.Oyuntuya	2	8	0	0	0
3.	Curbing corruption	B.Batzori	2	8	0	0	0
4.	Public legal education	M.Narantuya	3	7	0	0	0
5.	Public health	S.Dulmaa	3	7	0	0	0
6.	Human rights	B.Khishigsaikhan	3	7	0	0	0
7.	Multi-media	T.Zandmaa	4	6	0	0	0
		Sh.Otgonbaatar					
8.	Radio advertisement	S.Javzandulam	5	5	0	0	0
9.	How to prepare radio	B.Onon	4	4	0	0	0
	program using printed						
	materials?						
10.	How to prepare budget,	J.Enkhjargal	4	4	0	0	0
	and document the						
	income and expenditure						
11.	How to write proposal?	Kh.Naranjargal	5	5	0	0	0

Respondents recommended us we should pay an attention to the followings, if we organize the similar trainings in the future:

- To allocate more time for each topics
- To allocate more time for practices/group working
- o To involve more people
- To specialize to topics and more lesson deeper
- To allocate more time and more topics multi-media training
- To support accommodation, such as hotel

4.2 Production evaluation

It is extremely difficult to monitor the availability of radio productions on air and evaluate its quality due to the remoteness of the soums where radio stations based and limitation of

the regular trips to the locations. We have agreed with the SDC to use some of the funds to purchase the pre-paid telephone cards and contact the local listeners. The CRAMO is working to compile the list of at least 10 local citizens in each soum who would be able listen to the radios and monitor the radio activities and report back to the CRAMO. In January and February 2013, the CRAMO board members and executive director will visit all the 10 community radios and evaluate the situation. GI has agreed with the SDC to transfer the remaining 20 percent of the payment to the CRAMO account that they will commence the final payments after their evaluations and get the radio programs on CDs. It will take a time to get it by mail and the radios are not able to share it online because only soum is connected to high speed Internet and modems are weak to transfer the big audio files.

V. PROBLEMS/CONSTRAINS

Recruitment of Executive director

As a result of job announcement we received only two applications and we hired an acting executive director whose name is B.Jargalan, with fluent English and she has an experience working in the UNDP project in June 2012. Unfortunately, after a month she had to leave the job because of the serious health problem and needed for the long treatment. We started the recruitment again, but no applications received and GI offered our candidate to the CRAMO Board. On September 28, 2012 D.Munkhburen, lawyer of Globe International was appointed as an executive director of the CRAMO.

• Registration of newly born Association

The first action of the acting executive director was to register the CRAMO to the State Registration Office (SRO). It took us almost a half year because of bureaucracy, awareness of the officials of the SRO and requirement of too many documents to be submitted. It is funny to deny the registration because it has a word "radio" and supposed to be a radio station. Finally, the CRAMO received the State Registration Certification on November 30, 2012.

Radio productions of 10 radio uncompleted

As it mentioned earlier, five radio stations did not submit the production plans and the managers were not reachable on their cell phones. Even the Board chairmen or Board members whom we managed to reach were promising to tell the managers did not take their promises. It is matter of the responsibility and commitment of the managers.

Besides it, there also were some valid reasons, for example, in the extreme cold winter conditions, some stations have to temporarily stop its operations because of lack of financial resources to pay for heating or heating system frozen.

Globe International has sent the letter to the SDC for the prior approval of the budget change to:

- 1. Hire 10 local persons to report us on radio programming to monitor if planned productions aired and spend 200,000 MNT for pre-paid telephone
- 2. Use 1,150,000 for the printing costs of the UNESCO handbook: Community media: good practices. We have translated it by the grant of the UNESCO, Beijing, but no printing costs are covered. It is a very important source to educate on the community media sustainability and it will be useful reference material for the advocacy of enabling community media environment in Mongolia. SDC logo will be appeared in the published handbook.
- 3. Transfer the final payment for the community radios which equals in total 1,320,000 MNT (610,000 MNT budgeted for five stations and total 710,000 MNT budgeted for Altai soum radio) to the Community Radio Association so that they can make the bank transfer after the completion of their works and bank account opened in Altai, Khovd.

Please the copy of the letter. Attachment #8

VI. PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY

The project is sustainable in three ways:

- 1) GI has pledged to support the CRAMO and it is one of our strategic priorities. We have secured 13,000 USD from the UNESCO, Beijing to advocate the community media environment and organize the review trips to 10 soums. We have the agreements with the WHO and UNICEF to submit the project proposals. We are providing some training and financial support for 10 community radios as a part of our UNDEF-funded project "Increasing the Citizens' Access to Information to Promote Transparency and Integrity in Mongolia".
- 2) As a part of this project, the newly born CRAMO has its strategy and policy, and ability to organize the events. It has held the Advocacy seminar and carried out the studies and has good resources such as handbooks and fliers to spread knowledge on the community media and promote and educate on building the new community radios.

3) Finally, it is hoped the community media is officially recognized in Mongolia and will get the policy support in the National Program on Citizen Participation and Direct Democracy initiated by the President of Mongolia

VII. CONCLUSION/RECOMMENDATION

The project achieved its goal and objectives. We are sincerely thankful to the SDC, Mongolia for their contribution to make the project worked despite some difficulties described in this report.

However, the community radio development still needs further efforts to make it powerful and to spread it throughout the country. It is closely linked to other planned outputs of other SDC projects in Mongolia, so we hope the SDC will continue working towards enabling the legal environment to enable community radios and establishment of more community stations in Mongolia.

We recommend the SDC and our donors to continue supporting development and sustainability of the community radios and the CRAMO through:

- o Mentoring the leadership of the newly born association in its further activities and providing opportunities to learn te experiences of the successful radios and associations in the world
- Assisting to expanding its members by supporting establishment of more community radios whenever it is needed, for instance, in schools, hospitals, prison, artisanal mining locations etc
- Assist in making more favorable environment for the further development of community radios
- Provide the assistance to make the existing community radios more sustainable through trainings, production supports etc

Report by

Kh.Naranjargal, GI President
D.Munkhburen, CRAMO Executive Director

11/01/2013, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia